

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: August 11, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-056

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of August 25, 2011

SUBJECT: ITEM # 11 – NATHAN AND HATTIE RIGDON SPEC. HOUSE #1

APPLICANT: Goltz Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4240 Arguello Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House #1

located at 4240 Arguello Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House # 1 located at 4240 Arguello Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1917 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation includes portions of the interior and excludes the rear 216 sq. ft. addition and second story deck. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- 1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Prairie style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1917 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its hipped roof, wide overhanging boxed eaves, stucco cladding, a second story balcony which is above the porch roof, large square pillar porch supports, large bow window bays, as well as a variety of tall vertical fixed and operable windows. Interior elements include the octangular pillars located in the living room, dining room, and music room; the crown molding in the living room and music room; a set of wooden doors to the dining room which recess into the wall; a wooden door leading to the stairway with square glass window insets which also recesses into the wall; the wooden stair banister and railing; the built in cabinets in the dining room and music room; as well as the wooden mantel and tile surround in the living room.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Nathan Rigdon and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is a good example of Rigdon's work in the Prairie style and reflects a high level of design and quality construction.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is located at 4240 Arguello Way in the Uptown Community. The property consists of a two-story Prairie style home.

The historic name of the resource, the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House # 1 has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of Nathan and Hattie Rigdon, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria B, C, and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D but not HRB Criterion B. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The report indicated that the house is significant for its association with Donald E. Hanson, who lived at 4240 Arguello Way from 1945-1964. Mr. Hanson was said to be a civic leader and businessman. The Hanson family came to San Diego in 1927 when Donald was asked to audit a prominent San Diego business at the time, the Southern Spreckles Company. He then went on to become secretary and treasurer of the Spreckles Company in 1931 and was promoted to directing the ferry and railway branches of the firm while also becoming the vice president and comptroller of the San Diego Transit Company. Mr. Hanson was involved with over ten organizations in San Diego including serving as President of the San Diego Community Chest, the Chamber of Commerce, and trustee of the First Methodist Church. During the time he was living in this house he was chair of several San Diego chapter American Red Cross drives. Mr. Hanson also traveled with a delegation in 1944 to help plan San Diego's homecoming of servicemen returning from WWII. While highly involved in the San Diego community, there is not sufficient information to assert that Donald Hanson made significantly demonstrable achievements and/or contributions to the history of San Diego. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property was built in 1917 by established Master Builder Nathan Rigdon and embodies the distinct characteristics of Prairie Style architecture. The house features a broad hipped roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves. Underneath the roof line are large decorative stucco brackets supporting the soffit. Fenestration consists of several tall vertical fixed and operable windows many topped with smaller rectangular divided lights. Featured on the first floor are ribbons of tall vertical bow windows and above the windows is a hipped half barrel roof

with decorative blocks underneath the eaves. The house is clad in stucco including the chimney located on the south elevation. The front of the house exhibits a centered porch entryway with a flat roof supported by large square pillars. The porch roof supports a second story balcony.

The owner has requested to have portions of the interior included in the designation which is indicated on the attached floor plan and photo key (See Attachment 2). These interior elements include the octangular pillars (Picture #1) located in the living room, dining room, and music room; the crown molding (Picture #2) in the living room and music room; a set of wooden doors to the dining room which recess into the wall (Picture #3); a wooden door leading to the stairway with square glass window insets which also recesses into the wall (Picture #4); the wooden stair banister and railing (Picture #5); the built in cabinets in the dining room (Picture #6) and music room (Picture #7); as well as the wooden mantel and tile surround (Picture #8) in the living room.

Several modifications have occurred to the house throughout the years. This includes a 216 sq. ft remodel and addition in 1980 to the rear of the home in order to encompass a new family room, bathroom, laundry room, and deck and pergola which are not visible from public view. Other modifications include a roof replacement in 1977 and the addition of a modern brick walkway and porch added at an unknown date. These modifications do not affect the integrity of the building to a significant degree. Therefore, staff recommends designation under Criterion C with the exclusion of the rear 216 sq. ft. addition and second story deck which was built outside the period of significance.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's report states that the house is representative of the notable work of recognized Master Nathan Rigdon. Rigdon was born in Maryland in 1867 and was first listed in San Diego in 1909. He was known primarily for the construction of family homes but also constructed several multi-family residences and commercial buildings mostly in the Mission Hills neighborhood. Rigdon was known for his Craftsman and Prairie style architecture homes with the signature use of an integrated porch with second floor balcony. He was known for work done with the utmost quality and intricate use of wood throughout interior spaces. The house at 4240 Arguello Way is a good example of the quality craftsmanship Rigdon was known for in his Prairie Style Homes. Therefore, staff recommends designation under Criterion D for its association with Master Builder Nathan Rigdon.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House # 1 located at 4240 Arguello Way be designated with a period of significance of 1917 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation includes portions of the interiors and excludes the rear 216 sq. ft. addition and second story deck. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jennifer Feeley

Planning Intern

Cathy Winterrowd

Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JF/cw

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Photo key of interior elements included in Designation
- 3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/25/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/25/2011, to consider the historical designation of the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House # 1 (owned by Goltz Family Trust 05-21-96, 4240 Arguello Way, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **4240 Arguello Way**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **443-402-22-00**, further described as BLK 8 LOT 22 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House # 1 on the following findings:

- (1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of Prairie style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1917 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its hipped roof, wide overhanging boxed eaves, stucco cladding, a second story balcony which is atop the porch roof, large square pillar porch supports, as well as a variety of tall vertical fixed and operable windows. Interior elements included in this designation include the octangular pillars located in the living room, dining room, and music room; the crown molding in the living room and music room; a set of wooden doors to the dining room which recess into the wall; a wooden door leading to the stairway with square glass window insets which also recesses into the wall; the wooden stair banister and railing; the built in cabinets in the dining room and music room; as well as the wooden mantel and tile surround in the living room. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.
- (2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Nathan Rigdon and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is an example of Rigdon's work in the Prairie style and reflects a high level of design and construction.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.** The designation shall include portions of the interior and exclude the rear 216 sq. ft. addition and second story deck.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

| Vote: N/A | BY: |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|
| | JOHN LEMMO, Chair |
| | Historical Resources Board |
| APPROVED AS TO FORM AND | |
| LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, | BY: |
| CITY ATTORNEY | KEITH BAUERLE |
| | Deputy City Attorney |

4240 Arguello Way Interior Elements Included in Designation















