



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 8, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-062

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 22, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM 17 – Alice Lee/ Hazel Waterman House**

APPLICANT: Herzman Nieces Non-Execpt Trust represented by Paul and Sarai Johnson

LOCATION: 3574 7th Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Alice Lee/ Hazel Waterman House located at 3574 7th Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Alice Lee/ Hazel Waterman House located at 3574 7th Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1905-1943 under HRB Criteria A, B, C, and D. Additions at the North end totaling 429 square feet and the 528 square feet two car garage are excluded from the designation. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource is a special element of the City's and neighborhood's architectural, aesthetic, and social development and retains integrity. Specifically, the resource is an example of architectural and aesthetic development in San Diego being one of the first Prairie homes built in San Diego as part of a complex of three Prairie homes centrally located around a master designed landscaped courtyard. The house is important in the social development of San Diego having belonged to one of the first documented domestic partnerships in San Diego between Alice Lee and Katherine Teats.
2. The resource is identified with Alice Lee, a historically significant person who was important as a Civic leader of the Progressive movement in San Diego, and retains integrity for that association from 1905-1943.
3. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Prairie style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its low pitch hipped roof with composition shingles exposed rafter tails and overhanging eaves, heavy dash stucco cladding, fenestration consisting of a mixture of double hung, casement, slider and multi light fixed windows, a small entryway porch with stuccoed pillars and a large wooden front door flanked by decorative wood detailing and multi-light windows.

Development Services Department

1222 First Avenue, MS 512 • San Diego, CA 92101-4155
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 446-5499

4. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Hazel Waterman and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is a good example of one of Waterman's earlier works in the Prairie style under the supervision of Irving Gill.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is at 3574 Seventh Avenue in the Uptown Community and consists of a two story Prairie house.

The historic name of the resource, the Alice Lee/Hazel Waterman, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of a historically significant individual who owned and lived in the house and the name of Hazel Waterman, a Master Architect who designed the house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research was prepared by Paul and Sarai Johnson, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, B, C, D, E, and F. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria A, B, C, and D, but not HRB Criteria E and F. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The house at 3574 Seventh Avenue is a special element to the architectural and aesthetic development of San Diego. In 1905 Alice Lee contracted Hazel Waterman under the supervision of Irving Gill to develop her property consisting of lots 29- 33 bought from Thomas and Elizabeth Crittenden as well as lots 34-39 bought from George and Anna Marston. What came of this project was a set of three Prairie style homes, the first Prairie homes in San Diego, positioned in a "U" shape around a centralized courtyard planned by Master Landscape Architect Kate Sessions. This development was the first of its kind in San Diego well before the extension of the trolley line which occurred in 1909 as well as the 1910 announcement of the Panama California Exposition in Balboa Park. The house at 3574 Seventh Avenue is the central house of the set of three with the other two houses already having been designated. The original layout included the three Prairie homes set well back from the sidewalk and courtyard to allow for a spacious green belt to surround the houses. Sidewalks lined with young greenery connected the three houses with each other and the courtyard. Being one of three of the first Prairie houses in San Diego and part of a larger complex of three prairie houses arranged around a courtyard, the house at 3574 Seventh Avenue is considered a special element of the architectural and aesthetic development of San Diego. Therefore, staff recommends designation under Criterion A.

The house at 3574 Seventh Avenue is also important to the social development of San Diego. The first owner of this house was Alice Lee who lived here with her long time partner, Katherine Teats. They are said to be one of the first documented domestic partnerships in San Diego having been listed under the same household in many Census records and in 1930 Alice Lee was listed as Head of Household while Katherine Teats was listed as Partner. The two lived together in the home until Lee's death in 1943. Together they managed several investment properties throughout San Diego, were highly involved in various organizations throughout San Diego, and were said to be generally accepted for their lifestyle. Therefore, staff recommends designation under Criterion A as a special element to the social development of San Diego.

CRITERION B - *Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.*

Alice Lee was born in Westport, NY in 1854 and throughout her life was surrounded by individuals passionate about the Progressive movement including Teddy Roosevelt, who was married to her second cousin; Florence Nightingale; Ralph Waldo Emerson; and the Bronson Alcott family. When Lee moved to San Diego in 1902 for health reasons she became friends with the Marston Family who were involved with the Progressive movement in San Diego. Alice Lee became very involved with different organizations in San Diego including the First Unitarian Church, the Wednesday Club, the Civic Committee of the Chamber of Commerce, and other local civic and cultural groups. She took leadership positions as President of the San Diego Museum, Honorary Director of the Women's Civic Center, Director of the Natural History Museum, President of the Balboa Park Auditorium Association, and President of the Balboa Park Commission.

Alice Lee founded the group "Open Forum", which was a public forum to openly talk about social, political, and international issues. According to a newspaper article from the San Diego Union, by 1935 the group had become one of the "oldest continuous non-legislative forum of free public discussion in the United States" before being disbanded sometime in the 1970s. Lee was also a leader of the Progressive movement in San Diego organizing Progressive thinking women to get out and vote for Teddy Roosevelt in 1932. She was recognized by the Progressive Party by being chosen to represent California at the National Convention for the Progressive Party in Chicago. Lee was the leader of the "Save the Beaches" campaign in San Diego which resulted in the city acquiring miles of beach for public use. She was also instrumental in developing the public playground system. Alice Lee was praised as a Civic leader in several publications including the San Diego Union, the Ticonderoga Sentinel, the Boston Globe, and a book entitled *Women of the West: A Series of Biographical Sketches of Living Eminent Women in the Eleven Western States of the United States of America*. Lee lived in the home at 3574 Seventh Avenue from its year of construction in 1905 until her death in 1943. The period of significance for this house for its association with Lee is 1905-1943. Alice Lee has made significant contributions to San Diego history and therefore staff recommends designation under Criterion B for its association with Alice Lee.

The report also states that Katherine Teats was a significant individual in San Diego history. While she was definitely quite involved in the community there is not enough information to assert that Teats made any demonstrable achievements or contributions to San Diego. Therefore staff does not recommend designation under Criterion B for its association with Katherine Teats.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The house at 3574 was constructed in 1905 in the Prairie style and features a low pitched hipped roof with overhanging eaves and exposed rafter tails. Underneath the eave line is a thick cornice line which is parallel to the belt course located under the second story fenestration. Fenestration on the second story consists of a large central slider window flanked by symmetrical casement windows topped with smaller multi-light windows. The lower level features a small entryway brick porch with stuccoed support columns and a shed roof currently covered with overgrown vegetation. Underneath the porch roof is a large wooden door with square multi-light windows flanked by wood detailing and symmetrical multi-light windows similar to the pattern found on the front door. On either side of the porch are ribbons of rectangular fixed windows with smaller square multi-lights on top. Fenestration throughout the house varies and consists of double-hung, fixed, casement and slider windows. The house and brick chimneys are clad in heavy dash stucco.

Throughout the years several modifications have occurred to the home. First, there used to be a porch with a trellis on the South end of the property, as seen in the historic photographs, which is now enclosed. While Sanborn maps and historic photos show a setback one-story enclosed living space at the North end it seems subsequent additions at an unknown time have brought the East wall of this element forward to be flush with the main façade. At this time a second story balcony at the North end was also enclosed to create additional living space at the second story. Also at an unknown time one-story additions were made to the North elevation which are clearly distinguished from the rest of the house with a flat roof versus the hipped roof seen on the rest of the home. The one-car garage located on the North end of the property was expanded to become a two-car garage. Last, a pool was added to the West elevation of the property in 1964. The addition to the North side of the wall is generally a smaller addition and is clearly distinguished by a differentiating roof line therefore not significantly impacting the integrity of the home. The other one story additions to the home are clearly distinguished with a flat roof, are set back and out of public view. Therefore staff recommends designation under Criterion C, excluding the 429 square feet additions at the North end and the 528 square feet two car garage.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The report states that this property is significant for its association with several Master Architects including William Sterling Hebbard and Irving John Gill. While the house was commissioned through the Hebbard and Gill firm, the actual architect on the project was one of their associates, Hazel Waterman. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D for association with Hebbard and Gill.

Hazel Waterman is not already an established Master Architect, but after review of her overall work and acknowledgement of her work through peers and formal awards staff recommends the establishment of Waterman as a Master. Hazel Waterman was born in Tuskegee, Alabama in 1865 but moved to Northern California when she was three years old. She went on to study art at the University of California, Berkeley before marrying Waldo Waterman in 1889. The couple

then moved to Julian and later to San Diego where they contracted Irving Gill to help design and build their house overlooking the harbor.

Hazel Waterman was not originally an architect by education but her talent for design and spatial realization was recognized by Irving Gill after having worked with her and her husband on their home in 1900. Gill encouraged Waterman to consider taking up architecture after her husband died in 1903. While taking correspondence classes she began work with Hebbard and Gill tracing details from a standards book onto drawings from home. When Alice Lee and Katherine Teats began planning for the construction of their three homes in 1905 on Seventh Avenue they specifically asked to contract Hazel Waterman under Irving Gill's supervision. Not only were the homes on Seventh Avenue her first project but Waterman also designed the first Prairie homes in San Diego. Hazel Waterman went on to work on many other projects throughout San Diego including the restoration of Casa de Estudillo in 1909, the Wednesday Club house in 1911, and several personal residences. Working with Kate Sessions, she also worked briefly in landscape architecture having designed several landscapes for personal residences, especially those near Balboa Park.

Waterman was noted for her work, appearing in the publication "Pioneers of American Landscape Design"; and receiving an award from the San Diego Chapter of the AIA for the garden of Mr. and Mrs. Julius Wangenheim. Her obituary identifies her as a "noted architect". While the original plans for the house were not found, we know that Waterman was associated with the house at 3574 Seventh Avenue because of her personal project lists, journals, as well as through oral histories with individuals who were familiar with her work. Therefore, staff recommends establishing Hazel Waterman as a Master and supports designation under Criterion D.

The report also states that the landscaping was designed by Master Landscape architect Kate Sessions. Unfortunately, the original landscaping has been significantly altered and very little of her original plantings remain. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D for its association with Kate Sessions.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property has not been officially recognized by the National Park Service or the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the National or State Register. Therefore, the property is not eligible under Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property is not located within a designated Historical District. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

Recently plans were presented and approved by staff in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for restoration work on the house including opening up the one story element on the South end of the property to restore the original trellis, repairing the heavy dash stucco, and other work. While the work has already been approved work has not yet begun on the house.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Alice Lee/Hazel Waterman House located at 3574 Seventh Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1905-1943 under HRB Criteria A as a special element of the architectural, aesthetic and social development of San Diego, B for its association with Alice Lee, C as an example of Prairie style architecture, and D for its association with Master architect Hazel Waterman. The 429 square feet of the later additions at the North end and the 528 square feet two car garage shall be excluded from designation. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jennifer Feeley
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JF/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

ADOPTED ON 9/22/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/22/2011, to consider the historical designation of the **Alice Lee/ Hazel Waterman House** (owned by Herzman Nieces Non-Execpt Trust 12-15-72, PO Box 3129, San Diego, CA 92163) located at **3574 7th Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-430-16-00**, further described as BLK 2 POR in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Alice Lee/Hazel Waterman House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A as a special element to the architectural, aesthetic, and social history of San Diego. Specifically, the resource is an example of architectural and aesthetic development in San Diego being one of the first Prairie homes built in San Diego as part of a complex of three Prairie homes centrally located around a master designed landscaped courtyard. The house is important in the social development of San Diego having belonged to one of the first documented domestic partnerships in San Diego between Alice Lee and Katherine Teats. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION B for its association with Alice Lee, a historically significant person who was important as a Civic leader of the Progressive movement in San Diego, and retains integrity for that association from 1905-1943. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(3) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of Prairie style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1905 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its low pitch hipped roof with composition shingles exposed rafter tails and overhanging eaves, heavy dash stucco cladding, fenestration consisting of a mixture of double hung, casement, slider and multi light fixed windows, a small entryway porch with stuccoed pillars and a large wooden front door flanked by decorative wood detailing and multi-light windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(4) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Hazel Waterman. Specifically, the resource is a good example of one of Waterman’s earlier works in the Prairie Style under the supervision of Irving Gill. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation shall exclude the additions at the North end totaling 429 square feet and the 528 square feet two car garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney