

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 12, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-006

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of January 26, 2012

SUBJECT: ITEM #11 – The T.M. and Leonora H. Russell Speculation House

No.1

APPLICANT: Robert and Alexa Waltz represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 3141 Dale Street, San Diego, CA 92104, Greater North Park Community,

Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of The T.M. and Leonora H. Russell Speculation

House No.1 located at 3141 Dale Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the T.M. and Leonora H. Russell Speculation House No.1 located at 3141 Dale Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the 1930s historic garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource contains a cross-gabled roof with a front facing porch gable supported by two Neo Colonial style battered columns with the original Craftsman front door which are flanked by pairs of wide, double hung, sash windows. Included in the designation is the original 1930's vintage detached single car garage which retains its historical character and contributes to the architectural significance of the house.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a one story single family residence located in a low-density residential neighborhood in the Greater North Park

Community Planning area. The resource is surrounded by a mixture of Spanish Eclectic and Craftsman styled residences just east of Balboa Park.

The historic name of the resource, the T.M. and Leonora H. Russell Speculation House No.1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of T.M. and Leonora H. Russell, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Ronald V. May and Dale Ballou May of Legacy 106, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The building located at 3141 Dale Street is a single-family, 1,043 square-foot, one story Craftsman Bungalow constructed in 1922. The house features a low pitch, cross-gable roof with a front facing porch gable supported by two Neo Colonial style battered columns and inset panels. The apex of the front gable is vertical lath separated by four vertical boards that ventilate the attic crawl space. The gable exhibits an angle cut fascia board. There is a brick chimney on the north wall. The central front door is flanked by pairs of wide, double hung, sash windows. Several side gables protrude the south elevation and the one nearest the southwest corner exhibits a fixed oriel window topped by a composition shingle shed roof. The one nearest the southeast corner is a breakfast nook. The house has been well maintained and has excellent integrity within the public view.

The south side gables face a Hollywood driveway that leads to the 1930's vintage single car, 160 square-foot detached garage. The garage features a flat composition shingle roof with a crenulated or up-turned roof line. The structure is faced with yellow board and trimmed with white flat board with an old white wooden garage door.

Modifications to the house include roofing in 1969, interior modifications, and a second story addition over a basement storage area at the rear of the property. However, the new addition is not visible from Dale Street. The modifications do not significantly detract from the resource or impair its ability to convey significance as a Craftsman Bungalow with a period of significance of 1922.

The structure at 3141 Dale Street Craftsman Bungalow retains good integrity under Location, Design, Setting, Materials, Workmanship, and Feeling, with the Association element unmet. The house has retained architecturally defining features consistent with Craftsman design which includes but are not limited to a cross gabled roof, a front gabled porch supported by battered columns, and the original Craftsman front door. The house continues to convey the character

defining features of a Craftsman Bungalow style residence and is significant as such. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the T.M. and Leonora H. Russell Speculation House No.1 located at 3141 Dale Street be designated under HRB Criterion C with a period of significance of 1922. This recommendation was made based upon the information provided in the consultant report, the overall integrity of the house, and the retention of key architectural elements of Craftsman design, and Staff can determine that the house is significant and should be designated. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jeffrey Szymanski

Acting Senior Planner

Cathy Winterrowd

Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

js/cw

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 1/26/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/26/2012, to consider the historical designation of the Leonora H. Russell Speculation House No.1 (owned by Robert A. and Alexa L. Waltz, 3141 Dale Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **3141 Dale Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92104**, APN: **453-540-08-00**, further described as LOT H in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Leonora H. Russell Speculation House No.1 on the following finding:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource contains a cross-gabled roof with a front facing porch gable supported by two Neo Colonial style battered columns with the original Craftsman front door which are flanked by pairs of wide, double hung, sash windows. Included in the designation is the original 1930's vintage detached single car garage which retains its historical character and contributes to the architectural significance of the house. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A	
	BY:
	JOHN LEMMO, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED AS TO FORM AND	
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,	BY:
CITY ATTORNEY	KEITH BAUERLE
	Deputy City Attorney