

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	January 12, 2012	REPORT NO. HRB-12-008
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of January 26, 2012	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #7 – Annie Porter House	
APPLICANT:	Bankers Hill Property LLC represented by S	Scott A. Moomjian
LOCATION:	2126-30 Front Street, Uptown Community,	Council District 2
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Annie Porto Front Street as a historical resource.	er House located at 2126-30

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Annie Porter House located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1895 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear additions consisting of an approx 144 square feet one story addition constructed c. 1921 with an approx 144 square feet second story addition above constructed at an unknown date. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Queen Anne style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a hipped roof with a lower cross gable; clipped eaves; wood fish scale shingle siding at the pediment; narrow wood lap siding; a simple wood frieze and matching belt course along all elevations; a five-sided entry porch accented with decorative turned spindlework at the balustrade, posts and porch frieze; and three-over-one fixed and one-over-one double hung wood frame and sash windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The subject property is a two story Queen Anne style home constructed in 1895 in Horton's Addition.

Development Services Department 1222 First Avenue, MS 512 • San Diego, CA 92101-4155 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 446-5499 The historic name of the resource, the Annie Porter House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the owner, who constructed the house as her personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees, and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a two story Queen Anne style house constructed in 1895, and features a hipped roof with a lower cross gable; asphalt shingle roofing; clipped eaves; narrow wood lap siding over wood framing; and a concrete foundation with wood piers, floor joists and a sub-floor. The cross gabled pediment is finished with wood fish scale shingle siding. A simple wood frieze and matching belt course are present along all elevations. The highly distinctive five-sided entry porch is set to the southern half of the front façade, accessed via steps leading from the sidewalk, and is accented with decorative turned spindlework at the balustrade, posts and porch frieze. Fenestration consists primarily of three-over-1 fixed and one-over-one double hung wood frame and sash windows.

Sometime prior to 1921, the single family home was converted to a duplex and a second entry door was added directly south of the original entry door on the main façade. Also prior to 1921, a small rear porch was replaced with a larger one story addition with a basement below. The presence of a small rear porch is documented on the 1906 Sanborn Maps (Attachment 2). Circa 1952, a third unit was added at the rear of the home. Other modifications include removal of the original brick chimney; alteration of a window opening to a door opening above the porch; and the addition of a second floor above the one story rear addition at an unknown date.

The subject property exhibits many of the character defining features of the Queen Anne style, including the hipped roof with lower cross gable roof form; a front porch; decorative spindlework at the porch balustrade, posts and frieze; avoidance of flat wall surfaces and varying wall textures, which can be seen in the fish scale and wood lap siding, as well as the use of projecting bays and a simple decorative wood frieze and belt course; and simplified fenestration and trim. Aside from some minimal alterations to the fenestration and rear additions which are set back from the side facades, the house remains almost entirely intact, despite its neglected state. The house continues to convey the character defining features of a Queen Anne style residence and is significant as such. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Annie Porter House located at 2126-30 Front Street be designated with a period of significance of 1895 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Queen Anne style. The designation excludes the rear additions consisting of an approx 144 square feet one story addition constructed c. 1921 with an approx 144 square feet second story addition above constructed at an unknown date. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner

KS/cw

Attachments:

Cathery Sunternol

Cathy Winterrowd Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. 1906 Sanborn Map
- 3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 1/26/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/26/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **Annie Porter House** (owned by Banker's Hill Property LLC, 7660 Fay Avenue #H533, San Diego, CA 92037) located at **2126-30 Front Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92101**, APN: **533-162-14-00**, further described as Parcel 1 of Parcel Map No. 20707 being a consolidation of Lots "I" and the north 36 feet of the east 80 feet of Lot "H" in Block 250 of Horton's Addition, excepting there from that portion lying within Lot "H" of Horton's Addition in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Annie Porter House on the following finding:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the character defining features of the Queen Anne style and retains integrity from its 1895 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a hipped roof with a lower cross gable; clipped eaves; wood fish scale shingle siding at the pediment; narrow wood lap siding; a simple wood frieze and matching belt course along all elevations; a five-sided entry porch accented with decorative turned spindlework at the balustrade, posts and porch frieze; and three-over-one fixed and one-over-one double hung wood frame and sash windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the house as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation excludes the rear additions consisting of an approx 144 square feet one story addition constructed c. 1921 with an approx 144 square feet second story addition above constructed at an unknown date.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

KEITH BAUERLE Deputy City Attorney

JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

