



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 9, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-009

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of February 23, 2012

SUBJECT: **ITEM #5 – Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House and 1668
Columbia Street**

APPLICANT: Owner, represented by Marie Burke Lia

LOCATION: 1668 Columbia Street and 519 West Date Street, Downtown Community,
Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 1668 Columbia Street,
and the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House located at 519 West Date
Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 1668 Columbia Street under any adopted HRB Criteria; and designate the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House located at 519 West Date Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of c. 1885 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Folk Victorian Vernacular style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a truncated pyramidal roof; short, boxed eaves; a simple frieze; horizontal tongue and groove siding over box frame construction; a centered entry porch spanning nearly the entire width of the front façade with a moderately pitched half-hipped roof supported on tapered square columns on narrow wood piers; and fenestration consisting of tall 1-over-1 and 2-over-2 double hung wood frame and sash windows with wood surrounds.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a

constraints analysis for future development. The site is located in the Little Italy community of downtown and includes two structures, a single family house (converted to commercial use) constructed c. 1885 in the Folk Victorian Vernacular style at 519 West Date Street, and a duplex constructed in 1940 in a hybrid Spanish Eclectic/Moderne style at 1668 Columbia Street.

The historic name of the resource located at 519 West Date Street, the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the owners who moved the structure to the site in 1925 and resided there intermittently from 1928 until the construction of the adjacent duplex at 1668 Columbia Street in 1940, at which time they moved to the duplex and rented the West Date Street house to family members and others.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the Office of Marie Burke Lia, which concludes that the buildings on site are not significant under any HRB Criteria. The report includes information regarding owners Antonio and Josephine Giacalone, their role within the Italian-American fishing community, and whether the property reflects a special element of the Little Italy community. Research at the Little Italy Association, the Convivio Society for Italian Humanities, Maritime Museum and San Diego History Center failed to demonstrate that the subject property reflects a special element of the Italian-American fishing community or that the Giacalones would be considered historically significant. Staff therefore concurs that the property located at 1668 Columbia Street is not significant under any HRB Criteria, but disagrees that the property located at 519 West Date Street is not significant, and finds that it is eligible for designation under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The building located at 519 West Date Street is a one-story single family house (now converted to commercial use) constructed c. 1885 in the Folk Victorian Vernacular style and relocated to the subject property from an unknown location in 1925. The house features a truncated pyramidal roof with asphalt shingles; short, boxed eaves; a simple frieze; horizontal tongue and groove siding over box frame construction; and a wood pier foundation with concrete footings. The entry porch is centered across nearly the entire width of the front façade, and features a moderately pitched half-hipped roof supported on tapered square columns on narrow wood piers. A wood picket railing runs between the piers, defining the porch space, which is accessed via four wood steps. A pair of narrow wood entry doors with 8 narrow panes in the upper portion of the door and fixed, wood frame 2-lite transoms above provide access to the commercial spaces. The doors and entry configurations were not noted as a modification in the applicant's report. Tall 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows with wood surrounds flank the entry. Remaining fenestration consists of tall 2-over-2 double hung wood frame and sash windows with vertical divides and wood surrounds. At the rear of the house, a flat-roof section set under the eave of the pyramidal roof runs the width of the building. Based on the applicant's report, this rear element

appears to date to approximately the same time period as the rest of the house, and it is unknown whether or not it is an addition. A non-historic concrete slab porch with wood railing and a small flat wood roof over the rear entry door are the only known modifications.

Folk Victorian Vernacular architecture was popular roughly between 1870 and 1910, and is characterized by simplified Victorian era form and detailing, designed and constructed by local craftsmen. The pyramidal roof variant was constructed in one and two story versions. The subject property reflects a symmetrical pyramidal roof Folk Victorian Vernacular house, utilizing simplified Victorian era materials and detailing such as horizontal tongue and groove siding; tall double hung windows with a vertical emphasis, and a wide entry porch supported on squared posts. The property retains high integrity of design, materials, workmanship, and feeling. Integrity of setting and location have been compromised by infill development and the relocation of the house in 1925. However, these aspects of integrity are less critical to a resource significant for its architecture. As the house retains the relevant aspects of integrity from the c. 1885 period of significance and exhibits the distinctive characteristics of Folk Victorian Vernacular architecture, staff finds that the resource is significant as such and recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

The building located at 1668 Columbia Street is a one-story duplex over an exposed basement constructed in 1940 in a hybrid Spanish Eclectic/Moderne style. The building features a hipped roof clad in single barrel clay tile; clipped eaves; moderately textured stucco walls over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The entries at the east and west facades are accented with a small projecting stucco covers and are accessed via concrete stairs and landings with simple wrought iron railings. While the stucco and roofing are characteristic of Spanish style architecture, the articulation, detailing, fenestration pattern and appearance are more indicative of Moderne style architecture. Windows consist primarily of 2-over-2 double hung wood frame and sash units with horizontal divides, and are grouped in sets of two, primarily at the building corners. Two aluminum window replacements were noted, but no other significant modifications. The building is a rather simple duplex structure, embodying the characteristics of two styles, Spanish Eclectic and Moderne. The resulting structure is a modest example of hybrid styling, and is not eligible designation as an individual resource under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 1668 Columbia Street not be designated under any adopted HRB Criteria; and the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House located at 519 West Date Street be designated with a period of significance of c. 1885 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the character defining features of the Folk Victorian Vernacular style. Designation brings with it the

responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report and Addendum under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 2/23/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/23/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House** located at **519 West Date Street, San Diego, CA 92101**, APN: **533-351-08-00**, further described as BLK 31 LOT 12 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Folk Victorian Vernacular style and retains integrity to its c.1885 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a truncated pyramidal roof; short, boxed eaves; a simple frieze; horizontal tongue and groove siding over box frame construction; a centered entry porch spanning nearly the entire width of the front façade with a moderately pitched half-hipped roof supported on tapered square columns on narrow wood piers; and fenestration consisting of tall 1-over-1 and 2-over-2 double hung wood frame and sash windows with wood surrounds. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney