



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

MEMORANDUM

DATE: August 13, 2009
TO: HRB Boardmembers
FROM: Jodie Brown, AICP, Senior Planner, CPCI
SUBJECT: Item 7 – 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard

This item was continued from the July 23, 2009 meeting of the Historical Resources Board at the request of the applicant. Staff is in receipt of a memo dated July 22, 2009 from Kathleen Crawford and an email dated July 23, 2009 from Scott Moomjian and Ruth Alter. Both the memo and email concur with the consultant's original assessment that the house was constructed in the Modern Minimal Traditional style. Staff does not concur with this assessment and maintains that the house is a Ranch style.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Jodie Brown".

Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner

Attachments: 1. Email from Ruth Alter via Scott Moomjian, dated July 23, 2009
2. Email from Kathleen Crawford via Scott Moomjian, dated July 22, 2009
3. Historical Resources Staff Report dated July 9, 2009

Winterrowd, Cathy

From: smoomjian@earthlink.net
Sent: Thursday, July 23, 2009 8:26 AM
To: Brown, Jodie; Winterrowd, Cathy
Cc: K.J. Greene
Subject: Fw: 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard

Dear Jodie,

Below please find an e-mail from Ruth C. Alter regarding the classification of the 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard property as a Modern Minimal Traditional example. We would appreciate it if you would distribute this e-mail to the HRB at or before the meeting this afternoon.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Thank you.

Scott

-----Forwarded Message-----
From: "Ruth Gautereaux (Alter)"
Sent: Jul 20, 2009 3:54 PM
To: Scott Moomjian
Subject: 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard

Scott, the lines between Minimal Traditional and Ranch designs are often somewhat blurred in San Diego. Both styles are typically one story in height with low or medium pitched roofs, and both can have stucco cladding, sometimes with brick, wood, or stone detailing. Generally, a Minimal Traditional example will have a front facing gable, but this is not always the case. The eaves project further over the walls in Ranch architecture, and are clipped or narrow in Minimal Traditional.

In the present example, the garage roof provides the aforementioned front gable element, the eaves sit narrowly over the walls, and the focal bay window creates the Minimal Traditional feel of the house.

I concur that the style designation of Minimal Traditional that we assigned to the house as part of the Quieter Home Program is correct.

Sincerely,

Ruth C. Alter

Winterrowd, Cathy

From: smoomjian@earthlink.net
Sent: Thursday, July 23, 2009 8:29 AM
To: Brown, Jodie; Winterrowd, Cathy
Cc: K.J. Greene
Subject: 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard
Attachments: 2909 Chatsworth.doc

Dear Jodie,

Attached please find correspondence to me from Kathleen Crawford stating that the 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard property is Modern Minimal Traditional in style, rather than Modern Ranch. We would appreciate it if you would distribute Kathleen's comments to the HRB at or before the meeting this afternoon.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Thank you.

Scott

TO: Scott A. Moomjian, Esq.
FROM: Kathleen A. Crawford
DATE: July 22, 2009
RE: 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard

I have reviewed the 2005 Department of Parks and Recreation Department DPR 523 forms for the property located at 2909 Chatsworth Boulevard in the Loma Portal area of San Diego. I concur with our original assessment of the property that the residence is a good example of the Modern Minimal Traditional style.

The primary characteristics of the Modern Minimal Traditional style include: lack of decorative detailing; low or intermediate roof pitch; close eaves and rake; large chimney; at least one front-facing gable; wood, brick, stone or a mixture of wall cladding materials; and one- or two-story in height.

The characteristics of the Modern Ranch style include: rambling form maximizes the front façade width; built-in garage as integral part of the overall design; asymmetrical shape; low-pitch roof; overhanging rake and eaves; hipped, cross-gabled or side-gabled roofs, boxed or open eaves; exposed rafters; wood or brick wall cladding, small amounts of traditional detailing, sometimes based on Spanish or English Colonial precedents, decorative iron or wood shutters and/or porch supports; ribbon windows; large picture windows; partially enclosed patios or courtyards; and private outdoor living areas to the rear of the house.

I feel that the building is a good example of the Modern Minimal Traditional style because the structure contains all the major character defining elements of the style as stated above. In addition, the building does not have the long, low, rambling type of footprint and front façade that is characteristic of the Modern Ranch style. The building does not contain decorative detailing from traditional designs. The eaves are not overhanging as seen on the majority of Ranch style buildings. There are no decorative shutters, porch supports, enclosed patios or courtyards, or large picture windows. The building has a large bay window and multilite windows around the facades. Bay windows are not one of the defining characteristics of the Modern Ranch style. The garage on the subject property was originally detached and a later addition connected the garage to the house. An attached garage is a key characteristic of the Modern Ranch style and the subject property does not contain this character defining element of the Modern Ranch style.

Therefore, based upon a review of the character defining features of both styles and a reassessment of the original DPR forms, I consider the subject property to be a good example of the Modern Minimal Traditional style and that it does not display the character defining features of the Modern Ranch style.



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 9, 2009 REPORT NO. HRB-09-017

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of July 23, 2009

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 –2909 Chatsworth Blvd.**

APPLICANT: Kevin Greene and Raquel Birman-Greene, property owners
Represented by Scott Moomjian, consultant

LOCATION: 2909 Chatsworth Blvd., Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the house at 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria due to lack of historical significance; association with a Master Architect or Master Builder; or association with a person significant to San Diego's history.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board at the owner's request to have the house and site designated as a historical resource. The house at 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. is a single family home that was originally constructed in 1945 by Oral Carpenter, the original property owner. The house was constructed in the Ranch style.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, the consultant on behalf of the property owners, Kevin Greene and Raquel Birman-Greene, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C. Staff disagrees with the determination that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The house was originally constructed in 1945 in the Ranch style by the original owner, Oral Carpenter. The house was built during the third wave of construction for the Point Loma area. The third wave of construction was at the end of the war and was a result of a need for affordable housing for the military and defense industry personnel in San Diego.

The “U” shaped Ranch house has a low-pitched hipped roof sheathed with dimensional asphalt shingles (the original roof was shake shingles). The roof has closed eaves with gutters. The exterior walls are sheathed with semi-smooth stucco. The majority of the windows on the house are wood divided light windows that are either 4/4, 3/3 or 6/6 double hung. There are three bay windows on the house on the west, south and east elevations. Each bay windows have operable 4/4 double hung windows flanking fixed divided light windows. All of the windows and doors have been replaced through the Quieter Home Program (QHP). QHP declared the property a contributor to the Potential Loma Portal Historic District, but noted that it does not qualify for designation on its individual merits.

The front entrance is recessed from the front façade. The entrance features a brick surround and a metal security door. The walk way leading to the front entrance has non historic tile applied to the surface. To the left of the front door there is a bay window with a small metal roof. The south elevation features another bay window that is located to the right of an unpainted brick chimney.

The house is connected to the two car garage via an enclosed breezeway. It is unclear when the breezeway was enclosed. The enclosed breezeway is differentiated from this historic portion of the house by the use of brick with a running bond pattern. The breezeway features a wood paneled door and a glass block window. The garage has a hipped roof with a small vented cupola. The garage door has been replaced with a modern metal roll-up with small decorative windows.

The consultant has stated that the house is significant as a Modern Minimal Traditional style residence. Staff disagrees that the house is a Modern Minimal Traditional and contends that it is a Ranch style residence. As a Ranch style house it does not conform to the “Staff Procedures on Evaluating the Historical Significance of Post-War Ranch Houses” which was adopted by the HRB on May 9, 2005. The overall design of the house is based on the San Diego version of the Ranch style architecture. The design is based loosely on the Spanish Colonial styles present in the region. The Chatsworth residence is one-story and asymmetrical in design. It has a ground hugging silhouette fitted to the site with a low pitched roof with moderate overhangs and boxed

eaves. The house has smooth stucco with minimal decorative details. The south side also features an exposed exterior brick chimney commonly found on San Diego Ranch houses. Given the lack of association with a person significant to San Diego's history and no Master Builder/Architect association, staff does not recommend designation under Criteria C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended to not designate the house at 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jodie Brown
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

jb/cw

Attachment: Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover