



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 15, 2007 REPORT NO. HRB-07-030

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of June 28, 2007

SUBJECT: **ITEM 7 – MISSION HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT (2nd HEARING);
DR. LEON CASPER & DR. LOUISE DAVID LONG HOUSE
(1885 SHERIDAN AVENUE);
WILLIAM G. & FIDELIAN LEWIS MCKITTRICK HOUSE
(1875 SUNSET BOULEVARD)**

APPLICANT: Janet O’Dea and Allen Hazard (District)
Brian McCormack, owner (1885 Sheridan Avenue)
William and Robin Light, owners (1875 Sunset Boulevard)

LOCATION: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, defined by the properties fronting on Sunset Boulevard (inclusive of 1814 Sunset Blvd through 1898 Sunset Blvd) to the north; the homes fronting Sheridan Avenue to Lyndon Road (inclusive of 1801 Sheridan Ave through 1896 Lyndon Rd and 4107 Saint James Place) to the east and south; and the properties on the east side of Saint James Place to the west; individual site designations located at 1885 Sheridan Avenue and 1875 Sunset Boulevard; Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Review the Mission Hills Geographic/Traditional Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; consider the establishment of Morris Irvin as a Master Builder, consider the designation the Mission Hills Geographic Traditional Historic District and the contributing resources within the District, and finally, consider the designation of the properties at 1885 Sheridan Avenue and 1875 Sunset Boulevard as individually significant resources.



STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Board take the following actions:

1. Establish builder and developer Morris Irvin as a Master Builder.
2. Designate the Mission Hills Historic District under:
 - a. HRB Criterion A as a special element of the City and neighborhood's historical, cultural, landscaping and architectural development:
 - i. reflecting an association with San Diego Progressive Era civic politics, attracting many of San Diego's leading citizens, including doctors, lawyers, businessmen, educators and artists.
 - ii. reflecting the influence of the 1908 Nolen Plan through the use of progressive planning techniques, including broad main streets, a hierarchy of road widths, respect for the natural topography, the first use of curvilinear streets in the City, and the protection of deep ravines for recreation and scenic enjoyment.
 - iii. reflecting a high concentration of quality design and construction, with a substantial number of individually significant structures.
 - b. HRB Criterion C, as it embodies distinctive characteristics of various styles, types and period(s) of construction:
 - i. The District's period of significance, 1908-1942, represents two distinct architectural phases. The pre-World War I development reflects most strongly the cultural taste of the Progressive Era and its fascination with the Arts and Crafts. Its development between the wars is more closely associated with the Period Revival Styles, especially the Spanish Colonial Revival, popularized by the 1915 Panama-Pacific Exposition and includes the Minimal Traditional styles, which became popular and were used primarily as infill of the available lots that remained in the District after the Great Depression.
 - c. HRB Criterion D, as it reflects the quality design and construction work of several established Master Architects and Builders including:
 - i. Emmor Brooke Weaver
 - ii. Henry Harms Preibisius
 - iii. Requa and Jackson
 - iv. Frank P. Allen
 - v. William F. Wahrenberger
 - vi. Nathan Rigdon
 - vii. Martin Melhorn
 - viii. H.J. Lang
 - ix. Charles Tifal
 - x. David O. Dryden
 - xi. Brawner & Hunter
 - xii. The Pacific Building Company

3. Designate the following 58 Contributing Resources under HRB Criterion F.

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1808	Lyndon	443-612-08-00	5B	1870	Sheridan	443-611-20-00	5D3
1812	Lyndon	443-612-09-00	5D3	1875	Sheridan	443-612-04-00	5B
1819	Lyndon	443-650-24-00	5D3	1876	Sheridan	443-611-21-00	5D3
1820	Lyndon	443-612-10-00	5D3	1882	Sheridan	443-611-22-00	5D3
1831	Lyndon	443-650-25-00	5D3	1885	Sheridan	443-612-03-00	5D3
1833	Lyndon	443-620-10-00	5D3	1899	Sheridan	443-612-01-00	5B
1840	Lyndon	443-612-11-00	5B	1815	Sunset	443-611-12-00	5D3
1841	Lyndon	443-620-02-00	5B	1818	Sunset	443-432-20-00	5D3
1849	Lyndon	443-620-04-00	5B	1824	Sunset	443-432-18-00	5B
1850	Lyndon	443-612-13-00	5D3	1826	Sunset	443-432-17-00	5B
1853	Lyndon	443-620-05-00	5B	1829	Sunset	443-611-10-00	5B
1876	Lyndon	443-612-15-00	5D3	1830	Sunset	443-432-15-00	5D3
1877	Lyndon	443-620-17-00	5B	1835	Sunset	443-611-09-00	5B
1884	Lyndon	443-612-16-00	5D3	1836	Sunset	443-432-14-00	5B
1896	Lyndon	443-612-17-00	5D3	1845	Sunset	443-611-08-00	5B
4107	Saint James	443-611-24-00	5D3	1848	Sunset	443-432-13-00	5D3
1801	Sheridan	443-650-13-00	5B	1850	Sunset	443-432-12-00	5B
1807	Sheridan	443-650-15-00	5D3	1851	Sunset	443-611-07-00	5B
1815	Sheridan	443-650-17-00	5B	1863	Sunset	443-611-06-00	5B
1816	Sheridan	443-611-13-00	5B	1864	Sunset	443-432-11-00	5B
1824	Sheridan	443-611-14-00	5B	1870	Sunset	443-432-10-00	5B
1825	Sheridan	443-650-20-00	5D3	1871	Sunset	443-611-05-00	5B
1834	Sheridan	443-611-15-00	5D3	1875	Sunset	443-611-04-00	5B
1840	Sheridan	443-611-16-00	5B	1883	Sunset	443-611-03-00	5B
1845	Sheridan	443-612-07-00	5B	1889	Sunset	443-611-02-00	5B
1852	Sheridan	443-611-18-00	5B	1890	Sunset	443-432-07-00	5D3
1859	Sheridan	443-612-06-00	5D3	1895	Sunset	443-611-01-00	5B
1860	Sheridan	443-611-19-00	5B	1898	Sunset	443-432-05-00	5B
1867	Sheridan	443-612-05-00	5D3	Hitching Post in PROW at 1868 Lyndon			5D3

4. Establish the following 18 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1801	Lyndon	443-650-21-00	6Z	1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z
1805	Lyndon	443-650-22-00	6L	1823	Sheridan	443-650-19-00	6Z
1811	Lyndon	443-650-23-00	6L	1844	Sheridan	443-611-17-00	6L
1845	Lyndon	443-620-03-00	6Z	1889	Sheridan	443-612-02-00	6Z
1848	Lyndon	443-612-12-00	6Z	1890	Sheridan	443-611-23-00	6L
1855	Lyndon	443-620-06-00	6Z	1814	Sunset	443-432-23-00	6Z
1868	Lyndon	443-612-14-00	6Z	1821	Sunset	443-611-11-00	6L
1875	Lyndon	443-620-18-00	6Z	1874	Sunset	443-432-09-00	6Z
1811	Sheridan	443-650-16-00	6Z	1884	Sunset	443-432-08-00	6Z
1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z	1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z

5. Designate the property at 1885 Sheridan Avenue, the Dr. Leon Casper and Dr. Louise Davis Long House, as an individually significant resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman Bungalow architecture, and HRB Criterion D as the work of Master Builders Nathan Rigdon and Morris Irvin.
6. Designate the property at 1875 Sunset Boulevard, the William G. and Filelia Lewis McKittrick House, as an individually significant resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman architecture with Italian influences.
7. Direct staff to return to the Board with the Mission Hills District Development and Design Guidelines, as needed and appropriate, following input from the community.

BACKGROUND

This nomination is being brought before the Historical Resources Board (HRB) by the City of San Diego City Planning and Community Investment Department for consideration of designation as a Geographic/Traditional Historic District under the Land Development Code and HRB Policy 4.1, adopted April 25, 2002.

First Hearing

On May 24, 2007 the Board held the first hearing for the Mission Hills Historic District where the nomination was reviewed, deemed complete and forwarded to a second hearing for designation. At the first hearing the Board took the following actions:

1. Accepted the Mission Hills Historic District boundary as proposed in the nomination.
2. Accepted the Period of Significance of 1908-1942.
3. Accepted the Historic Context with direction to further develop the element related to pre-history and early settlement of the greater Mission Hills area.
4. Accepted the Statement of Significance as written in the nomination.
5. Directed staff to bring forward additional information to support the establishment of Morris Irvin as a Master Builder.
6. Reclassified 1811 Lyndon Street from 6Z to 6L.
7. Reclassified 1805 Lyndon Street from 6Z to 6L.
8. Accepted the classification of 57 non-contributing resources as follows:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1808	Lyndon	443-612-08-00	5B	1870	Sheridan	443-611-20-00	5D3
1812	Lyndon	443-612-09-00	5D3	1875	Sheridan	443-612-04-00	5B
1819	Lyndon	443-650-24-00	5D3	1876	Sheridan	443-611-21-00	5D3
1820	Lyndon	443-612-10-00	5D3	1882	Sheridan	443-611-22-00	5D3
1831	Lyndon	443-650-25-00	5D3	1885	Sheridan	443-612-03-00	5D3
1833	Lyndon	443-620-10-00	5D3	1899	Sheridan	443-612-01-00	5B
1840	Lyndon	443-612-11-00	5B	1815	Sunset	443-611-12-00	5D3
1841	Lyndon	443-620-02-00	5B	1818	Sunset	443-432-20-00	5D3
1849	Lyndon	443-620-04-00	5B	1824	Sunset	443-432-18-00	5B
1850	Lyndon	443-612-13-00	5D3	1826	Sunset	443-432-17-00	5B
1853	Lyndon	443-620-05-00	5B	1829	Sunset	443-611-10-00	5B
1876	Lyndon	443-612-15-00	5D3	1830	Sunset	443-432-15-00	5D3
1877	Lyndon	443-620-17-00	5B	1835	Sunset	443-611-09-00	5B
1884	Lyndon	443-612-16-00	5D3	1836	Sunset	443-432-14-00	5B

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1896	Lyndon	443-612-17-00	5D3	1845	Sunset	443-611-08-00	5B
4107	Saint James	443-611-24-00	5D3	1848	Sunset	443-432-13-00	5D3
1801	Sheridan	443-650-13-00	5B	1850	Sunset	443-432-12-00	5B
1807	Sheridan	443-650-15-00	5D3	1851	Sunset	443-611-07-00	5B
1815	Sheridan	443-650-17-00	5B	1863	Sunset	443-611-06-00	5B
1816	Sheridan	443-611-13-00	5B	1864	Sunset	443-432-11-00	5B
1824	Sheridan	443-611-14-00	5B	1870	Sunset	443-432-10-00	5B
1825	Sheridan	443-650-20-00	5D3	1871	Sunset	443-611-05-00	5B
1834	Sheridan	443-611-15-00	5D3	1875	Sunset	443-611-04-00	5B
1840	Sheridan	443-611-16-00	5B	1883	Sunset	443-611-03-00	5B
1845	Sheridan	443-612-07-00	5B	1889	Sunset	443-611-02-00	5B
1852	Sheridan	443-611-18-00	5B	1890	Sunset	443-432-07-00	5D3
1859	Sheridan	443-612-06-00	5D3	1895	Sunset	443-611-01-00	5B
1860	Sheridan	443-611-19-00	5B	1898	Sunset	443-432-05-00	5B
1867	Sheridan	443-612-05-00	5D3				

9. Accepted the classification of 18 non-contributing resources as follows:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1801	Lyndon	443-650-21-00	6Z	1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z
1805	Lyndon	443-650-22-00	6L	1823	Sheridan	443-650-19-00	6Z
1811	Lyndon	443-650-23-00	6L	1844	Sheridan	443-611-17-00	6L
1845	Lyndon	443-620-03-00	6Z	1889	Sheridan	443-612-02-00	6Z
1848	Lyndon	443-612-12-00	6Z	1890	Sheridan	443-611-23-00	6L
1855	Lyndon	443-620-06-00	6Z	1814	Sunset	443-432-23-00	6Z
1868	Lyndon	443-612-14-00	6Z	1821	Sunset	443-611-11-00	6L
1875	Lyndon	443-620-18-00	6Z	1874	Sunset	443-432-09-00	6Z
1811	Sheridan	443-650-16-00	6Z	1884	Sunset	443-432-08-00	6Z
1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z	1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z

10. Accepted the nomination as a whole and forwarded the district nomination to a second hearing for designation.

Following the May 24, 2007 hearing, the applicant conducted additional research on several properties which staff has classified as non-contributing. An email correspondence is included as Attachment 1. The applicant will present these findings to the Board at the June 28th hearing for their consideration.

Staff Response to Board Direction

Based upon direction given by the Board at the first hearing, staff has made several modifications and clarifications to the district nomination. These modifications and clarifications include the following:

1. Staff reviewed and compiled information from three City documents related to pre-history, early settlement and the Presidio, as well as a website which provides information on the

Kumeyaay village of Kosa'ii (Cosoy), to provide a more thorough and accurate accounting of the early history of the greater Mission Hills area. City documents referenced in this early history element of the context statement include *San Diego Presidio Condition Assessment Report* (prepared by KEA Environmental Inc.), *Draft Prehistoric and Historic Archaeology of Metropolitan San Diego: A Historic Properties Background Study* (referenced section prepared by Richard Carrico), and *City of San Diego Land Development Manual: Historic Resources Guidelines, Appendix A*. The referenced website can be found at www.cosoy.org. The revised historic context with the expanded "Pre-History, Early Settlement and the Presidio" element has been included as Attachment 2.

2. The Board directed staff to prepare a draft resolution for the designation of the Mission Hills Geographic/Traditional Historic District. The draft resolution has been included as Attachment 3.
3. Staff has presented additional information to support the establishment of Morris Irvin as a Master Builder. This information was provided by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea in their site specific historic resource research report for 1885 Sheridan Avenue (Attachment 6). This additional information is summarized in the "Analysis" section of this report.
4. The status code of the properties at 1805 Lyndon Street and 1811 Lyndon Street were changed from 6Z to 6L.
5. Although not explicitly directed through a motion, the Board requested that staff attempt to find additional building information for the property at 1884 Sunset. Staff went back through the permit records and Development Services as well as the Residential Building Record and could not find any reference to an addition at the porch. At his time staff's recommendation regarding this property remains unchanged; however, the applicant will be providing testimony at the Board hearing to support designation of this property as a contributing resource.

District Record

Upon designation of the Mission Hills Geographic/Traditional Historic District, staff will prepare a California Department of Parks and Recreation DPR-523D form for the file using the information provided in the district nomination as approved by the HRB in their action to designate the district.

Hitching Post

Staff neglected to call out the hitching post in the public right-of-way in front of 1868 Lyndon Road as a contributing resource to the district in the May staff report. This has been corrected, and staff is now recommending designation of 58 contributing resources (57 buildings and 1 object) and 18 non-contributing resource.

ANALYSIS

Historical Significance of the Mission Hills District

The Mission Hills District lies within the original Mission Hills Subdivision Map #1115 that was created by George Marston, Tom and C.S. Hamilton, E.S. Babcock, John and James Forward and John and Charles Kelly in 1908. The District is an excellent example of a (1908-1942) suburban residential development prior to the U.S. involvement in World War II incorporating Progressive-Era planning principles and containing an eclectic mix of architectural styles including California Bungalow, Craftsman Bungalow, Mission Revival, Spanish Colonial Revival, Prairie School Style,

Dutch Colonial Revival, Tudor Revival, Italianate Revival and pre-war and post-war Minimal Traditional homes built by a number of established Master Architects and Builders. Establishing the historical significance of a district under the adopted HRB Historical District Policy is a two-step process which requires that one or more of criteria “a” through “k” identified in the District Policy be utilized in determining the significance of an area proposed for district designation. The district is then designated under the standard adopted Board Criteria A-E, as supported by the analysis under the District Policy criteria. Contributing resources are then designated under Criterion F. The significance criteria identified in the District Policy which apply to the Mission Hills District, and the corresponding HRB designation criteria are as follows:

“c.” Rare Past: *A district which was once representative of common existence during a specific historic era but is now rare or unusual. Such as: an example of architecture, artistry, or design once common, now rare, or a function or use once common, now rare.*

The District is strongly associated with San Diego Progressive Party’s civic politics and financial improvement at the beginning of the 20th century. Progressives like George W. Marston and his extended family, the Hamilton’s and Kelly’s shared the vision that magnanimous civic action by leaders, like themselves, shaped the future of San Diego. Those powerful San Diego figures embraced city planning as a cure to urban problems and believed residential housing communities should surround civic parks, transportation routes and harbor resources. From its inception, Mission Hills attracted many of San Diego’s leading citizens, including doctors, lawyers, businessmen, educators and artists. Its men and women were typically members of several of San Diego leading civic groups, a reflection of the Progressive politics of the period. These included the Cuyamaca Club, the Elks, the Junior League, the Fine Arts Society, the Masons, the Thursday Club, the University Women’s Club, the Wednesday Club, and the San Diego Rotary Club.

The subdivision design and overall appearance of Mission Hills was strongly influenced by the innovative 1908 Nolen Plan (the “Plan”) for San Diego. Steeped in the City Beautiful tradition, the Plan advocated broad main streets, and hierarchy of road widths. Respect for the natural topography resulted in the city’s first use of curvilinear streets, as well as the protection of deep ravines for recreation and scenic enjoyment. Subdivision Map #1115 was the first use of these progressive planning techniques in San Diego. Even today, the neighborhood is distinguished from adjoining urban fabric by its unique planning that strongly adds to its intense sense of time and place.

This relates to HRB Criterion A, as a special element of the City and neighborhood’s historical, cultural, landscaping and architectural development.

“d.” Development Progression: *Neighborhoods or districts illustrating the progressive development of style and changes in architectural and cultural taste.*

The District’s period of significance, 1908-1942, represents two distinct architectural phases. The pre-World War I development reflects most strongly the cultural taste of the Progressive Era and its fascination with the Arts and Crafts. Its development between the wars is more closely associated with the Period Revival Styles, especially the Spanish Colonial Revival, popularized by the 1915 Panama-Pacific Exposition and includes the minimal traditional styles, which became popular and were used primarily as infill of the available lots that remained in the District after the Great Depression.

This relates to HRB Criterion C as the District embodies distinctive characteristics of various styles, types and period(s) of construction.

“e.” Consistent Plan: *Districts illustrating the development of coherent or consistent planning and design, or innovations in planning philosophy.*

The subdivision design and overall appearance of Mission Hills was strongly influenced by the innovative 1908 Nolen Plan (the “Plan”) for San Diego. Steeped in the City Beautiful tradition, the Plan advocated broad main streets and hierarchy of road widths. Respect for the natural topography resulted in the city’s first use of curvilinear streets, as well as the protection of deep ravines for recreation and scenic enjoyment. Subdivision Map #1115 was the first use of these progressive planning techniques in San Diego. Even today, the neighborhood is distinguished from adjoining urban fabric by its unique planning that strongly adds to its intense sense of time and place.

This relates to HRB Criterion A as a special element of the City and neighborhood’s historical, cultural, landscaping and architectural development.

“i.” Craftsmanship: *Examples of workmanship, craftsmanship, artistry, or design which would today be economically infeasible or difficult to reproduce and/or are of benefit to the contemporary community as significant reminders of the past.*

The Mission Hills District is characterized by resources ranging from Craftsman and Prairie to Mission and Spanish Revival which exemplify quality design and construction. In addition, the District is comprised of a remarkably high concentration of Master Architect designed and/or Master Builder constructed homes. According to research performed by the applicant, over twenty builders were identified within the boundaries of this district, including established Master Architects Emmor Brooke Weaver (2), Henry Harms Preibisius (2), Requa and Jackson (1), Frank P. Allen (1), and William F. Wahrenberger (1), and established Master Builders Nathan Rigdon (2, plus 2 he built with Morris Irvin), Martin Melhorn (3), H.J. Lang (2), Charles Tifal (2), David O. Dryden (1), Brawner & Hunter (1), and the Pacific Building Company (2). In addition, 7 resources were built by Morris Irvin (plus 2 he built with Nathan Rigdon), who is proposed as a Master Builder as part of this district nomination. Other architects and builders include Mark Christoffer, Louis Preibisius, John W. Gernandt, Robert Orr, Henry Lord Gay, George Daley, James O’Marr, John Graves, Powell & Fogg, Thomas Harbo, L. Eugene Fuller, Ideal Home Builders, Benjamin Torgerson, The Pacific Ready Cut Homes, A.M. Southard Building Company, Edward Rambo, Edward Bryans, Charles Gaines, James Taylor, Clinton Brainerd, Andrew Watson Woods, Joseph Bonfield Burness, and Forrest Heatt.

This relates to HRB Criterion C in that it embodies distinctive characteristics of certain styles, types and period of construction; and HRB Criterion D as reflective of the notable work of several Master Builders and Master Architects.

“k.” Landmark Supportive: *District of quality buildings or sites, often made up of individual landmark structures supported by other structures of somewhat lesser importance. Such districts are normally easily definable and have a significance over and above the sum of the values of each historic site because of the total historic environment.*

The Fort Stockton Line District contains a high concentration of quality buildings, including five designated historical resources, 28 resources which have been identified by staff as potentially significant as individual resources in their current condition, and two resources which have an application pending in the queue which are being brought forward with this item for individual designation as well as contributing resource designation. These individually significant resources are interspersed with and supported by other resources of varying degrees of significance and integrity, which taken together have a higher value because of the total historic environment.

This relates to HRB Criterion A as reflecting special elements of the cultural and architectural development of the neighborhood; and HRB Criterion C as the District embodies distinctive characteristics of various styles, types and periods of construction and craftsmanship.

Future District Expansion

The proposed Mission Hills District is a portion of the larger Mission Hills Subdivision Map 1115, and is proposed as the first phase of a larger district effort based on Map 1115. Although not contained entirely within Map 1115, the Fort Stockton Line Historic District encompasses portions of Map 1115 along West Lewis and Fort Stockton Drive. This leaves three large portions of Map 1115 yet to be surveyed at an intensive level. The boundary of Map 1115, the proposed Mission Hills and Fort Stockton Line historic districts, and the three areas of future intensive survey are identified in Attachment 4. It is anticipated that these three areas would be surveyed in the future and incorporated into the Mission Hills District through a district amendment which will require a boundary modification and possibly a modification of the period of significance, depending upon the results of the intensive survey. The process for amending the district would be determined by the Land Development Code and by the District Policy in effect at the time the district is amended, and would include public workshops, noticing and public hearings before the Board.

Establishment of Morris Irvin as a Master Builder

Morris Irvin was born in Illinois in May 1868. By 1880, the family (including his father, John, his mother, Hannah, his brother Frank and his two sisters Laura and Hattie) was living in Kearney City, Nebraska. By 1900, Irvin was working as a dry goods merchant and living in Creighton, Nebraska with his wife, Ida, and a daughter, Doris. Irvin arrived in San Diego in 1912 or 1913, just prior to the 1915-1916 Pan Pacific Exposition. On April 13, 1915, Irvin incorporated the Irvin Security Company, a general contracting firm that was established to buy, sell, lease and deal in real estate in order to build speculative structures, either for sale or for lease. From the company's office at 522 B Street, the Irvin Security Company would become the means by which Irvin would finance and build over 125 homes in Mission Hills over the next 15 years until his death in July 1933 at the age of about 65 years.

While Irvin built a number of Craftsman houses during his early San Diego career (1912-1916), he is mostly recognized today for his California Craftsman (stucco bungalows), called "sea gull" bungalows (sometimes called "eyebrow" bungalows) and Mission Revival and Spanish Revival single-story homes. A row of Irvin "sea gull" bungalows can be found along Stephens and Randolph Streets just outside the boundaries of the Mission Hills District. There are several more Irvin-built Mission and Spanish Revival homes built between 1921 and 1924 in this immediate area surrounding the District as well as a concentration of Irvin Spanish Revival bungalows along Hickory Street.

At the May 24, 2007 HRB meeting, the Board directed staff to provide additional information to support the establishment of Irvin as a Master Builder. The obituary for Irvin provided in the site specific historic resource research report prepared for 1885 Sheridan Avenue credits him as the “pioneer realtor of Mission Hills” through the Irvin Security Company. The obituary also identifies him as the builder of the first large apartment building in Mission Hills on Goldfinch Street. In addition to the structures identified in the May 15, 2007 report, over 30 additional properties have been identified as the work of Morris Irvin. Photos of these known properties have been included as Attachment 5.

Based on the information provided to date, it is evident that Irvin was an accomplished builder who built homes in a range of styles from Craftsman to Prairie and Spanish Revival. Many of the homes exhibit a distinct quality and character. His homes are well-executed and are of quality design and craftsmanship. Based upon this additional information regarding the scope and quality of Irvin’s work, staff recommends that Irvin be established as a Master Builder.

Proposed Designation of Two Individually Significant Properties

As part of the district nomination, staff is bringing forward two individual site nominations within the boundary of the district which are currently in the queue for individual designation. The information in these reports is germane to the significance of the district as a whole, and it is appropriate to consider the individual significance of these properties awaiting designation during the establishment of the district. Staff analysis of the site specific historic resource research reports for each property is as follows:

1885 Sheridan Avenue: Dr. Leon Casper and Dr. Louise Davis Long House

The house at 1885 Sheridan Avenue is a two-story, California Craftsman bungalow, single-family residence built by Nathan Rigdon and Morris B. Irvin in 1919. A historical report was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O’Dea (Attachment 6) and proposes designation under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C (Architecture) and HRB Criterion D (Master Builder) as follows:

Criterion C: The house is a two-story, single-family residence built by Nathan Rigdon and Morris B. Irvin in 1919 as a California Craftsman bungalow. The 2,946 square foot house is composed of a low pitch front gable roof with composition shingles, wide overhanging eaves with exposed rafters and smooth stucco over wood framed walls set on a concrete foundation. A pergola extends from the front porch on the east side. Two massive simple columns support and frame the front porch. The front façade contains two wood fixed windows which have seven over one divided light panels. The original front door is oak with three beveled glass panels. Alterations to the residence include removal of the garage, and in its place, an addition was created which utilized the slope of the lot to add a basement and a half story above the original roofline. As a good example of Craftsman architecture retaining a good degree of integrity, staff recommends individual designation under HRB Criterion C.

Criterion D: The applicant recommends that the house be designated under HRB Criterion D as the work of Nathan Rigdon and Morris Irvin. Rigdon was responsible for the design and

construction of houses as well as commercial and apartment buildings throughout the city; however a significant portion of his work was in Mission Hills, especially along West Lewis Street and Fort Stockton Drive. He designed houses in several styles including many in his own version of the Prairie style, which was popular among Progressives. In addition to Prairie designs, Rigdon also planned buildings in the Craftsman style. Interestingly, many of his houses are easily identified by his signature use of an integrated entry porch and second floor balcony. Rigdon designs are known for their high quality, functional floor plans and extensive use of wood throughout the interior spaces. He contributed significantly to the architectural heritage of San Diego, and the Mission Hills area in particular, and has been established by the Board as a Master Builder with the designation of three houses (HRB Sites #711, 785 and 786). An additional two properties designed by Rigdon were designated under Criterion C (HRB Sites #621 and 625).

Although Morris B. Irvin has not yet been established by the Board as a Master Builder, substantial information has been brought forward to support the establishment of Irvin as a Master (as noted previously in this report). Morris arrived in San Diego between 1912 and 1913, and on April 13, 1915 incorporated the Irvin Security Company, a general contracting firm that was established to “buy, sell, lease and deal in real estate” in order to “build houses or other buildings, either for sale or for lease.” Over the next 15 years, Irvin financed and built over 125 homes in Mission Hills, including three currently designated resources (HRB Site 3414, 611 and 794). There is sufficient evidence to establish Irvin as a Master Builder, and staff recommends that the property be individually designated under HRB Criterion D as the work of Master Builders Nathan Rigdon and Morris Irvin.

1875 Sunset Boulevard: The William G. and Fidelia Lewis McKittrick House

The house at 1875 Sunset Boulevard is a two-story, single-family residence, built in 1911-1912, in the vernacular Craftsman style with Italian influences. A historical report was prepared by Ron May (Attachment 7) and proposes designation under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB C (Architecture) as follows:

Criterion C: The house is a two-story, single-family residence, built in 1911-1912, in the vernacular Craftsman style with Italian influences. The McKittrick House is composed of a hipped roof with composition shingles, shed dormers, wide overhanging ornate cornices with exposed rafters, horizontal siding with wide bargeboard set on a concrete foundation with a partial basement. There is a brick chimney on the west elevation. There are wood double hung and casement windows throughout. The porch on the east elevation is covered with a balustrade and pergola. The north elevation exhibits a bay window with a small balustrade. The garage in the rear has the original sliding barn doors. As a good example of Craftsman architecture with Italian influences retaining a high degree of integrity, staff recommends individual designation under HRB Criterion C.

CONCLUSION

At this time, staff recommends that the Board take the following actions:

1. Establish builder and developer Morris Irvin as a Master Builder.
2. Designate the Mission Hills Historic District under:

- a. HRB Criterion A as a special element of the City and neighborhood’s historical, cultural, landscaping and architectural development:
 - i. reflecting an association with San Diego Progressive Era civic politics, attracting many of San Diego’s leading citizens, including doctors, lawyers, businessmen, educators and artists.
 - ii. reflecting the influence of the 1908 Nolen Plan through the use of progressive planning techniques, including broad main streets, a hierarchy of road widths, respect for the natural topography, the first use of curvilinear streets in the City, and the protection of deep ravines for recreation and scenic enjoyment.
 - iii. reflecting a high concentration of quality design and construction, with a substantial number of individually significant structures.
- b. HRB Criterion C, as it embodies distinctive characteristics of various styles, types and period(s) of construction:
 - i. The District’s period of significance, 1908-1942, represents two distinct architectural phases. The pre-World War I development reflects most strongly the cultural taste of the Progressive Era and its fascination with the Arts and Crafts. Its development between the wars is more closely associated with the Period Revival Styles, especially the Spanish Colonial Revival, popularized by the 1915 Panama-Pacific Exposition and includes the Minimal Traditional styles, which became popular and were used primarily as infill of the available lots that remained in the District after the Great Depression.
- c. HRB Criterion D, as it reflects the quality design and construction work of several established Master Architects and Builders including:
 - i. Emmor Brooke Weaver
 - ii. Henry Harms Preibisius
 - iii. Requa and Jackson
 - iv. Frank P. Allen
 - v. William F. Wahrenberger
 - vi. Nathan Rigdon
 - vii. Martin Melhorn
 - viii. H.J. Lang
 - ix. Charles Tifal
 - x. David O. Dryden
 - xi. Brawner & Hunter
 - xii. The Pacific Building Company

3. Designate the following 58 Contributing Resources under HRB Criterion F.

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1808	Lyndon	443-612-08-00	5B	1870	Sheridan	443-611-20-00	5D3

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1812	Lyndon	443-612-09-00	5D3	1875	Sheridan	443-612-04-00	5B
1819	Lyndon	443-650-24-00	5D3	1876	Sheridan	443-611-21-00	5D3
1820	Lyndon	443-612-10-00	5D3	1882	Sheridan	443-611-22-00	5D3
1831	Lyndon	443-650-25-00	5D3	1885	Sheridan	443-612-03-00	5D3
1833	Lyndon	443-620-10-00	5D3	1899	Sheridan	443-612-01-00	5B
1840	Lyndon	443-612-11-00	5B	1815	Sunset	443-611-12-00	5D3
1841	Lyndon	443-620-02-00	5B	1818	Sunset	443-432-20-00	5D3
1849	Lyndon	443-620-04-00	5B	1824	Sunset	443-432-18-00	5B
1850	Lyndon	443-612-13-00	5D3	1826	Sunset	443-432-17-00	5B
1853	Lyndon	443-620-05-00	5B	1829	Sunset	443-611-10-00	5B
1876	Lyndon	443-612-15-00	5D3	1830	Sunset	443-432-15-00	5D3
1877	Lyndon	443-620-17-00	5B	1835	Sunset	443-611-09-00	5B
1884	Lyndon	443-612-16-00	5D3	1836	Sunset	443-432-14-00	5B
1896	Lyndon	443-612-17-00	5D3	1845	Sunset	443-611-08-00	5B
4107	Saint James	443-611-24-00	5D3	1848	Sunset	443-432-13-00	5D3
1801	Sheridan	443-650-13-00	5B	1850	Sunset	443-432-12-00	5B
1807	Sheridan	443-650-15-00	5D3	1851	Sunset	443-611-07-00	5B
1815	Sheridan	443-650-17-00	5B	1863	Sunset	443-611-06-00	5B
1816	Sheridan	443-611-13-00	5B	1864	Sunset	443-432-11-00	5B
1824	Sheridan	443-611-14-00	5B	1870	Sunset	443-432-10-00	5B
1825	Sheridan	443-650-20-00	5D3	1871	Sunset	443-611-05-00	5B
1834	Sheridan	443-611-15-00	5D3	1875	Sunset	443-611-04-00	5B
1840	Sheridan	443-611-16-00	5B	1883	Sunset	443-611-03-00	5B
1845	Sheridan	443-612-07-00	5B	1889	Sunset	443-611-02-00	5B
1852	Sheridan	443-611-18-00	5B	1890	Sunset	443-432-07-00	5D3
1859	Sheridan	443-612-06-00	5D3	1895	Sunset	443-611-01-00	5B
1860	Sheridan	443-611-19-00	5B	1898	Sunset	443-432-05-00	5B
1867	Sheridan	443-612-05-00	5D3	Hitching Post in PROW at 1868 Lyndon			5D3

4. Establish the following 18 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1801	Lyndon	443-650-21-00	6Z	1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z
1805	Lyndon	443-650-22-00	6L	1823	Sheridan	443-650-19-00	6Z
1811	Lyndon	443-650-23-00	6L	1844	Sheridan	443-611-17-00	6L
1845	Lyndon	443-620-03-00	6Z	1889	Sheridan	443-612-02-00	6Z
1848	Lyndon	443-612-12-00	6Z	1890	Sheridan	443-611-23-00	6L
1855	Lyndon	443-620-06-00	6Z	1814	Sunset	443-432-23-00	6Z
1868	Lyndon	443-612-14-00	6Z	1821	Sunset	443-611-11-00	6L
1875	Lyndon	443-620-18-00	6Z	1874	Sunset	443-432-09-00	6Z
1811	Sheridan	443-650-16-00	6Z	1884	Sunset	443-432-08-00	6Z
1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z	1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z

5. Designate the property at 1885 Sheridan Avenue, the Dr. Leon Casper and Dr. Louise Davis Long House, as an individually significant resource under HRB Criterion C as a

good example of Craftsman Bungalow architecture, and HRB Criterion D as the work of Master Builders Nathan Rigdon and Morris Irvin.

6. Designate the property at 1875 Sunset Boulevard, the William G. and Filelia Lewis McKittrick House, as an individually significant resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman architecture with Italian influences.
7. Direct staff to return to the Board with the Mission Hills District Development and Design Guidelines, as needed and appropriate, following input from the community.

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Saunders
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

KS/gw/cw

- Attachment(s):
1. Email from Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea
 2. Revised "Pre-History, Early Settlement and the Presidio" element of the Historic Context
 3. Draft Resolution
 4. Map Illustrating Future Expansion of the Mission Hills District
 5. Photos of Additional Morris Irvin Properties
 6. 1884 Sheridan Historic Resource Research Report (under separate cover)
 7. 1875 Sunset Historic Resource Research Report (under separate cover)
 8. Staff Report dated May 15, 2007 (without attachments)