



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 23, 2007 REPORT NO. HRB-07-018

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of April 26, 2007

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – South Park Commercial Properties: Burlingame Garage, Rose Grocery, Fire Station No. 9, and 2141 and 2143 30th Street**

APPLICANT: Ronald V. May of Legacy 106 on behalf of Save Our Heritage Organisation (not the property owners)

LOCATION: 2227 30th Street; 2215-2219 30th Street; 2211 30th Street; and 2141 and 2143 30th Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of each of the listed properties as individual historical resources.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Burlingame Garage and Rose Grocery as individual historical resources under Criterion A for their association with the historical, social and economic development of the South Park neighborhood and under Criterion C as good examples of Mission Revival architecture expressed in a commercial structure. Designate the Fire Station No. 9 as an individual historical resource under Criterion A for its association with the historical and social development of the South Park neighborhood and under Criterion C as a unique and good example of Craftsman architecture expressed in a municipal building. Do not designate the structure located at 2141 and 2143 30th Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity from its 1925 period of significance.



Planning Department

202 C Street, MS 4A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a nomination for historical designation under San Diego Municipal Code Section 123.0202, which allows nomination of a historical resource by any member of the public by submitting a research report for consideration by the Board. The nomination consists of four structures:

- Burlingame Garage, 2227 30th Street, constructed in 1914, Mission Revival
- Rose Grocery, 2215-2219 30th Street; constructed in 1923, Mission Revival
- Fire Station No. 9, 2211 30th Street, constructed in 1913, Craftsman
- Munter & Munter Gas Station, 2141 and 2143 30th Street, constructed in 1925, vernacular automotive/commercial office

The Burlingame Garage, Rose Grocery and Fire Station No. 9 rest on contiguous lots along the east side of 30th Street. The Munter & Munter Gas Station is located to the south, at the intersection of 30th Street and Ivy Street, also along the east side of 30th Street.

ANALYSIS

A historical report was prepared by Ronald V. May of Legacy 106 on behalf of SOHO that concludes that the four subject structures are part of a historic district and recommends designation under HRB Criteria A and C, as special elements of the area's built landscape that reflect the evolving nature of transportation and commercial enterprises in South Park and embodying distinctive characteristics of architecture. The district nomination does not comply with the adopted HRB District Policy in that no precise boundary was identified, there is no owner support for establishment of the district, the proposed period of significance spans 42 years (1913 to 1955) and three distinct architectural styles (Mission Revival, Craftsman, and automotive/commercial office) are present in just four structures suggesting they are not related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way, and because geographic boundaries are not defined or justified, there is no discussion of contributing and non-contributing sites within the proposed district. With the concurrence of the applicant, Bruce Coons of SOHO, staff reviewed the structures individually and agrees that three of the four structures, the Burlingame Garage, Rose Grocery and Fire Station No. 9, located at 2227 30th Street; 2215-2219 30th Street; and 2211 30th Street, respectively are significant historical resources, staff does not concur that these properties should be designated as a historic district and does not concur that the structure located at 2141 and 2143 30th Street (Munter & Munter Gas Station) is a significant historical resource, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The Burlingame Garage, Rose Grocery and Fire Station No. 9 exemplify special elements of the South Park neighborhood's social and economic development reflecting both commercial enterprises and public services within the mostly residential, early suburb of San Diego. The subject properties served the community's shopping and fire safety needs through the Great Depression of the 1930s and WWII until the trolley terminated and Fire Station No. 9 shut down in 1949. Located adjacent to the San Diego Electric Railway line, these resources represent two

distinct episodes in San Diego history. The first is the development phase when wealthy and powerful visionaries collaborated to develop the supportive infrastructure of a trolley, fire station and automotive garage to serve the future residents of East San Diego. The second is the social history phase in which the Rose Grocery developed in the 1920s as a key commercial node to serve the surrounding community. Although the Munter & Munter Gas Station at 2141 and 2143 30th Street was also constructed and operated during the social phase of the South Park development, it no longer exemplifies or reflects that special element due to a loss of integrity of the structure, including a loss of the gas pumps and signage, and significant change in the immediate surroundings related to later phases of development.

For these reasons, staff believes that the Burlingame Garage, Rose Grocery, and Fire Station No. 9 exemplify and reflect special elements of the City's, the Greater North Park community's and the South Park neighborhood's social and economic development. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the Burlingame Garage, Rose Grocery and Fire Station No. 9 at 2227 30th Street; 2215-2219 30th Street; and 2211 30th Street, respectively under Criterion A. Staff further recommends that the Munter & Munter Gas Station, 2141 and 2143 30th Street, not be designated under Criterion A due to a loss of integrity.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

The Burlingame Garage was constructed in 1914 in the Mission Revival architectural style. It consists of fired, hollow clay tile blocks mortared, coated with scratch coat and paint. The front façade boasts a geometric parapet and the original multi-paned windows and double garage doors survive. The structure is finished with stucco and has a wood barrel vaulted roof covered with cinder felt. The original gooseneck lamp and roof vent are present and faint traces of "Burlingame Garage" can be seen along the front façade. Two wide windows flank the central garage doors. Five-paned transom windows decorate the top of large display windows below. The structure extends the full length of the lot, from 30th Street on the west to Fern Street on the east. The rear façade is intact with the original ceiling air vent and four windows with six panes each. The condition of the structure has deteriorated over time and currently some windows are broken and boarded and stucco and paint are cracked and peeling. There do not appear to be any recent additions to the structure or significant loss of historic fabric. The Burlingame Garage embodies distinctive characteristics of the Mission Revival architectural style expressed in a commercial structure and retains substantial integrity from its 1914 period of significance. Therefore staff recommends designation of the Burlingame Garage as an individual historical resource under Criterion C as a good example of Mission Revival architecture expressed in a commercial structure.

The Rose Grocery was constructed in 1923 also in the Mission Revival architectural style. It consists of fired, hollow clay tile blocks mortared, coated with scratch coat and white plaster that is now painted pink, with stucco along the side walls and recessed front. The front façade exhibits a classic low curvilinear Mission Style parapet with two wide arches topped by enamel lamps and a porthole vent. Inset from the arches is a wooden façade with two relatively new garage doors and original multi-paned windows. The pedestrian doors are original, but are currently boarded with plywood. The structure includes the original barrel-vaulted roof. Rows

of transom windows above pedestrian doors, windows, and another more modern garage door appear original, although added later. The corrugated roll up door is old, but cannot be dated and a historic photo could not be located. Both glass panel doors are 1920s vintage with current vertical boards above one door probably sealing a transom window. The large plate glass windows probably seal original entries into the grocery. The roll up door probably would have been a barn door. The larger transom window amidst the ribbon of windows above the doors is original. It is expected that many of the modifications to openings along the front façade occurred during the 1940s. A large addition to the rear of the building in 1954 extended the structure to Fern Street on the east. This addition is constructed of cement block with a flat roof. The rear façade includes original steel window casings, metal roll up door and delivery stoop. This addition cannot be seen from 30th Street and does not detract from the architectural significance of the original Mission style elements visible along the front façade. The condition of this structure has also deteriorated over time; however there does not appear to be a significant loss of historic fabric. The Rose Grocery embodies distinctive characteristics of the Mission Revival architectural style expressed in a commercial structure and retains a moderate level of integrity from its 1923 period of significance. Therefore staff recommends designation of the Rose Grocery as an individual historical resource under Criterion C as a good example of Mission Revival architecture expressed in a commercial structure.

Fire Station No. 9 was constructed in 1913 in the Craftsman architectural style and is the oldest remaining fire station in the City and the only surviving one built in the Craftsman style. The rectangular structure exhibits a front-gabled roof and fired hollow clay tile sidewalls bonded with cast concrete filled-in with mortared, fired, red common clay bricks and coated with beige painted stucco. The wooden gabled roof structure has three exposed triangular knee braces and exposed rafter tails along the side. The fire station identification is still visible along the gabled face on a horizontal board topped by vertical board-on-board facing. To each side of the front are door entrances with paneled wooden doors and both ornamental and simple brass hardware. The fire truck entrance includes the original double doors. The four sets of multi-pane windows are intact, although sealed. The historical research report includes a historic photo on page 27 that can be compared to the current structure. As can be seen, nearly all of the original elements and Craftsman detailing are present. The original brick facing can be distinguished under the current stucco coat. Although repairs have been made to the top portion of the chimney, it appears mostly intact. The lower half of two front windows is covered with plywood, but all twelve original windowpanes in the upper sash appear original. Windows in the south and east walls all appear original. The roof and gable have not been modified. At the rear, east elevation two rooms were added to the structure, probably during the 1940s. There are no building records or photographs that can provide the date of construction. These elements are not highly visible from 30th Street and do not detract from the architectural significance of the structure. The condition of this structure has also deteriorated over time; however there does not appear to be a significant loss of historic fabric. Fire Station No. 9 embodies distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman architectural style expressed in a municipal structure and retains a high level of integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Therefore staff recommends designation of Fire Station No. 9 as an individual historical resource under Criterion C as a unique and good example of Craftsman architecture expressed in a municipal building.

The Munter & Munter Gas Station was constructed in 1925 in a simple, vernacular style using clapboard siding with a gable-ended roof on a concrete deck. This small, rectangular structure served as the commercial office of an early gasoline station. New wide fascia board has been placed along the side elevations and it is not known whether any original windows existed. A narrow front and side door are now present. The gasoline pumps and original signage have been removed. A recent structure has been constructed on the same parcel with automobile storage, engine parts, temporary awnings, and modern advertising present. Staff disagrees with the conclusions of the historical report that the setting retains the sense of a service station. The original structure is adjacent to modern more intense automotive uses and is overpowered by larger, dominating structure to the south. The original gasoline pumps and sense of the early days of automotive service are lost in the current setting. Therefore, staff recommends the structure located at 2141 and 2143 30th Street (Munter & Munter Gas Station) not be designated as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity from its 1925 period of significance.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Burlingame Garage, Rose Grocery and Fire Station No. 9 located at 2227 30th Street; 2215-2219 30th Street; and 2211 30th Street, respectively be designated under HRB Criteria A and C and that the structure located at 2141 and 2143 30th Street not be designated as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax, the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code, flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements, the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit, which allows flexibility of use, and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Cathy Winterrowd
Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

Attachment: Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover