

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	April 12, 2007	REPORT NO. HRB-07-019
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of April 26, 2007	
SUBJECT:	ITEM # 9 – 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue	
APPLICANT:	Marie Burke Lia on behalf of Nutmeg & Olive LLC, owner and The Cathedral Church of St. Paul, developer	
LOCATION:	2761-2765 Fifth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the prop Avenue as a historical resource.	erty located at 2761-2765 Fifth

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue under any HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed major building modification (demolition) of a structure of 45 years or more, located at 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue, under San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212.

This two-story Spanish Eclectic-style sixteen-unit bungalow court, known as the "Park Chateau" Apartment Building, was constructed in 1939 of stucco over wood frame, and rests on a concrete foundation. The two rectangular structures have shallow Mansard-style clay tile gable roofs with brief overhangs with exposed wood beam ends.





Planning Department 202 C Street, MS 4A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical report was prepared by Kathleen Crawford. The report concludes that the structures are not historically or architecturally significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff concurs that the property is not significant under any HRB Criterion as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

HRB staff believes that the property does not exemplifies or reflect special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. For that reason, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Although the vacant site was associated with several historically-significant individuals prior to the 1939 construction of the structures, it is not identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history after 1926.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

The multi-family residential structure(s) at 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue are listed as ca.1930 on the 2007 Uptown Survey as "appears to be eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation or needs a historical research report to determine potential historical significance." The Notice of Completion was filed on December 20, 1939. The historical research report is attached to this staff report.

The two-story Spanish Eclectic-style bungalow court rectangular residential structures at 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue were constructed in 1939 for Mrs. Mabel Merkley by builder J. H. Nicholson. Although the stucco on wood frame/clay tile Mansard-roofed living portions of the structures are primarily intact, with minor window alterations, the Residential Building Record indicates that multiple alterations have been done to the stairs, and staff believes, to the balconies. These alterations which occurred in the 1950s and 1960s significantly impact the historic fabric of a defining element of the bungalow court, the architecture facing the courtyard itself. These balconies and balcony roofs are visible from the public right-of-way.

It appears that the original balconies and stairs, which were probably constructed of wood, may have been reconstructed with metal pipe columns and metal stairs. Staff believes that the structural profile, end closures and materials of the balconies and roof at this location are out of character with a 1939 Spanish Eclectic-style structure. The use of pipe columns and metal stairs leads staff to conclude that the structures are not good examples of the Spanish Eclectic style of architecture, and do not embody distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction. Nor is the property a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship. For this reason, staff does not recommend designation of the 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue structures based on HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The identity of the architect of the property was not determined. The builder, J. H. Nicholson is not identified as a Master Builder. For that reason, staff does not recommend designation of the 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue apartment based on HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

Not applicable.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

Not applicable.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that 2761-2765 Fifth Avenue not be designated under any HRB Criteria. If designated, designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Michael Tudury

Senior Planner/Architect

Cathy Winterrowd Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

MT/cw

Attachment: Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

en antearrow and an east anteachy and a solution obtained to style a problem (particle) and an east of the enantearrow and the reaction of the solution of the east of the mount of the first over the control of the east conferences any of the follower and a first first a contract or the effective of the first of the first of the conferences and the solution of the first first and the contract of the east of the first of the first

것 19 일관이다. 또 않는 것, 같은 가장에서 할 방법에서 있는 것으로 보니 그는 것이라. 이번 가장에서 가지 않는 것이다. 이번 것이다. 이번 것이 만들을 가지 않는 ~~ 다 가지만 그 분야가 한 것으로 같은 것이 모양은 사람으로 한 것이다. 같은 것이다. ~~ ~~ 한 것이다. 것이다.

'n besteken en jaar meter van set dan en geween en set dae sop hand. 'E naterikken dat in Nederman ja met blev Hiet op a Muster Besteken Franking van aan vie Perken of teen van envend Banigmad**en vi**r film. 1744 - 2016 Nikk ter verda er meter oorterend ingend om 1962 Octoering in.

ਦਾ ਕਿ ਇੱਕ 1997 ਦਿੱਤਾ ਨੇ ਸੱਸਿਆਂ ਦਾ ਇੱਕ ਜਿਹਾ ਸੱਖੂ ਦਾ ਅਮੇ ਨੇ ਦਾ ਦੇ ਸਿੱਖੇ ਦੇ ਸਾਹਿਤ ਦਿੱਤਾਂ ਕਿ ਦੱਸਾਂ ਦੇ ਦਾ ਸੱਚ ਸਿੱਖ ਇ ਦਾ ਤੱਥ ਤਿੱਕ ਕਿ ਕਿ ਇੱਕ ਮੁੱਖਣਾਂ ਨੂੰ ਦਿੱਤਿਆ ਕਿ ਦੇ ਜਿਸ ਦੇ ਦਾ ਨੇ ਇੱਕ ਦੇ ਸੱਖ ਦੇ ਦਾ ਸਾਹਤ ਦੇ ''ਜਿਸਾਂ 1997 ਦਿੱਤਾਂ ਦੇ ਸੱਚ ਇਹ ਇੱਕ 1997 ਦੀ ਦੇ ਸ਼ੁਰਾ 1997 ਦੀ ਇਹ ਦੂੰ ਦਿੱਤਾਂ ਕਿ ਦਿੱਤਾਂ ਦੂ ਦਾ ਸੱਖ ਦੇ ਇਹ ਦੇ ਉਹ ਸ਼ੁਰਾ ਦਾ ਇਹ ਸੱਖ ਦੀ ਸਿੰਘ ਸ਼ਾਦਤ

同合い変もある

and HERODA E – A stapistic program to specify and a proving state of the state of the state of the state of the even at Errory and the South Marke all the state or courted with the state of the state of the South Carry a specific distribution different of the state or courted with a second distribution of the South Carry state for the state of the state of the state or program for the second distribution of the South Carry and the state of state of the state of

- addited in paper and the

Freeze en titte nationalistics of earlier to the fille construction in the extractions to note that a given is an extraction of the tempeters and and a construction of the construction of the extra structure that by the extractions and the earlier of the construction of the tractic end of the extra of the extra structure that by the endersity of the tempeters of the construction of the tractic end of the extra structure that the extra structure endersity of the tempeters of the construction of the tractic end of the extra structure that the reference of the tempeters of the constructure of the tractic end of the extra structure for a fillence to the fillence of the constructure of the tractic end of the extra structure for the tempeters of the tempeters and the tractic ender the tractic end of the extra structure for a fillence to the fillence of the tempeters and the tractic end of the extra structure of the enders of the enders of the tempeters and the tractic enders the tractic enders of the enders of the enders of the tempeters and the tractic enders the tractic enders of the enders of the enders of the tempeters and the tractic enders of the tempeters of the tempeters of the enders of the enders of the tempeters of the enders of the tempeters of tempeters.

Calif. 110 Minusio Data Programme Development

- - I av

2014년 1월 21년 1월 1월 26일 - 1월 28일 1월 28일 1월 20일 1월