



**Minutes for Meeting of  
Thursday, November 9, 2017**

**Item 1: Call to Order**

Commission Chair Cochran called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

**Item 2: Roll Call**

**Present** – Commission Chair Deborah Cochran, and Commissioners Bill Baber, Fred Kosmo, Alex Kreit, Joe Leventhal, and Dave Potter

**Absent** – Commission Vice Chair Sid Voorakkara

**Staff** – Executive Director Stacey Fulhorst, General Counsel Christina Cameron, Education Program Manager Stephen Ross, Audit Program Manager Rosalba Gomez, and Program Coordinator Victoria Velasquez

**Item 3: Approval of Commission Minutes of October 12, 2017**

Motion:	Approve Minutes
Moved/Seconded:	Potter/Leventhal
Vote:	Carried Unanimously
Absent:	Voorakkara

**Item 4: Non-Agenda Public Comment**

None

**Item 5: Commissioner Comment**

Commissioner Kosmo mentioned that he attended the candidate training conducted by Executive Director Fulhorst on October 13, 2017, and complimented Ms. Fulhorst on an informative training session. He noted that only one other individual attended the training, and Ms. Fulhorst explained that the training is not mandatory and is offered three to four times per election cycle for those who wish to take advantage of the opportunity.

**Item 6: Executive Director Comment**

None

**Item 7: General Counsel Comment**

None

**Item 8: Proposed Amendments to Election Campaign Control Ordinance**

Executive Director Fulhorst provided an overview of the staff report and chart regarding the proposed amendments to the City's campaign advertising disclosure laws to reflect recent changes in state law. She noted that the material in the memo will also be on the docket for continued discussion and consideration at the Commission's December meeting. She reported that the staff has solicited input from the public concerning the proposed amendments by contacting local campaign treasurers and disseminating information via the Commission's Interested Persons email list.

Commissioner Leventhal expressed his opinion that the Commission should revisit the City's \$10,000 threshold for the top three major donors' disclosure because it is more challenging for committees to track contributions below the state's \$50,000 threshold. Director Fulhorst responded that although the lower threshold could result in more contributions to consider for purposes of determining the top two or three, it doesn't make the process more challenging because there are almost always multiple contributors competing for the top two or three spots, regardless of threshold. Moreover, she noted that campaign software enables committees to easily identify the top donors at any point in time. Finally, she referred to a sampling of campaign data from the 2014 and 2016 elections to point out that there were not a substantial number of contributions over \$10,000. Commissioner Kosmo commented that he understands why there is a \$50,000 threshold for state elections, but believes that a \$10,000 donation is a material amount of money for a City campaign.

In response to Commissioner Baber's concern about committees not receiving information regarding non-monetary contributions in a timely manner, Director Fulhorst advised that the new state law gives committees seven days lead time to identify their top donors.

Commissioner Baber pointed out that all donor information is available online to the public, to which Director Fulhorst responded that many state and local governments recognize the importance of requiring donor information on campaign advertisements as it immediately provides recipients with the information, and not all voters will have the knowledge or desire to look up donor data elsewhere.

Commission Chair Cochran and Commissioner Baber suggested the City could impose a more restrictive law than the state by requiring disclosures on campaign literature to be printed in black ink.

Commissioner Potter asked if the City could be more restrictive than the state and require that top donors be listed on separate lines on yard signs and billboards. Director Fulhorst confirmed that the City could decide to be more restrictive in this regard.

Commissioner Baber commented that he is generally in favor of consistency when it comes to applying disclosure laws to different types of committees; however, he commented that the quarter-screen disclosure requirements applicable to PFRC television advertisements are extremely onerous and suggested the Commission consider keeping the state's framework, which does not require that candidate ads devote a particular amount of space to the disclosure.

**Item 9: Adjourn to Closed Session**

Commission Chair Cochran adjourned the meeting to closed session at approximately 6:15 p.m. She stated the Commission would reconvene into open session following the conclusion of closed session in order to report any action taken during the closed session portion of the meeting.

**Reconvene to Open Session**

Commission Chair Cochran called the meeting back into open session at approximately 6:35 p.m.

**Reporting Results of Closed Session Meeting of November 9, 2017**

Ms. Cameron reported the results of the closed session meeting of November 9, 2017:

**Item-1: Conference with Legal Counsel (5 potential matters)**

**Case Nos. 2017-32, 2017-33, 2017-35, and 2017-36 – Reporting Campaign Contributions: Lobbying Firms and Organizations**

Motion:	Authorize Investigations
Moved/Seconded:	Potter/Cochran
Vote:	Carried Unanimously
Absent:	Voorakkara

**Case No. 2017-34 – Reporting Campaign Contributions: Lobbying Firm**

Motion: Authorize Investigation  
Moved/Seconded: Cochran/Potter  
Vote: Carried Unanimously  
Absent: Voorakkara  
Recused: Leventhal

**Item-2: Conference with Legal Counsel (1 potential matter)**

**Case No. 2017-25 – Content of Campaign Statements; Presentation of Final Audit Report Regarding Mike Aguirre for Mayor 2013**

Motion: Approve Stipulation and Accept Audit Report  
Moved/Seconded: Baber/Potter  
Vote: 5-1 (Leventhal voted nay)  
Absent: Voorakkara

**Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at approximately 6:40 p.m.

[REDACTED]

---

Deborah Cochran, Chair  
Ethics Commission

[REDACTED]

---

Victoria Velasquez, Program Coordinator  
Ethics Commission

***THIS INFORMATION WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE IN ALTERNATIVE FORMATS UPON REQUEST.***

###