



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 12, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-027

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of May 26, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #5 – Sherlock Fay House**

APPLICANT: Alexis and Shawna Volen represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 1111 Golden Gate Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Sherlock Fay House located at 1111 Golden Gate Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Sherlock Fay House located at 1111 Golden Gate Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style with Mission Revival influence and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1924 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features asymmetrical façades; stucco exterior; flat roof with stepped parapet; fenestration consisting of recessed, multi-lite wood casement and double hung windows; arched accent windows; and entryway highlighted by an arched stucco recess.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The subject resource is a one-story single-family residence built in 1924 in the Spanish Eclectic style with Mission Revival influences on a lot overlooking Mission Valley on the south side of Golden Gate Drive, between Ney York Street and Delaware Street, in the University Heights Subdivision of the Uptown Community.

The building is located on APN 444-135-03-00. The property was identified in the Draft 2007 Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Sherlock Fay House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Sherlock Fay, who constructed the house as a personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Technical Report was prepared by Brian F. Smith and Associates, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 1111 Golden Gate Drive did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Uptown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 1111 Golden Gate Drive did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one-story, single-family residence built in 1924 in the Spanish Eclectic style with Mission Revival influence. The building is sited on a north-facing lot on the south side of Golden Gate Drive with striking views over Mission Valley. Built of standard clay tile construction on a concrete foundation, the building exhibits an irregular plan form and is clad in a medium sand finish stucco. The flat roof form features a stepped parapet which, in conjunction with the exterior stucco chimney at the front elevation and the irregular plan form, gives the appearance of varying wall planes and massing. The Mission Revival influence in the building is expressed primarily through this varied, stepped parapet at the roofline.

The primary entry is accessed from an uncovered tile patio at the northeast corner of the building, and features a deep inset 15-lite wood door with a pair of 5-lite sidelights positioned under a distinct arched stucco recess. Adjacent to the entry, two small arched, 6-lite wood casement windows

overlook the patio. Fenestration throughout generally consists of wood casement and double hung windows appearing in groups or singly, and all recessed within the wall plane. Three pairs of 2-over-1 light casement windows appear at the primary elevation on either side of the chimney and feature stem wall supports for window boxes below. Attic vents are neatly centered over each of these window sets. A stucco archway connects a detached garage to the main residence at the rear, southwest corner of the property.

Alterations to the subject property are minimal and do not significantly impact character defining features or impair integrity as it relates to the 1924 date of construction and period of significance. Alterations noted in the report include the boarding up of a rear door on the south elevation and the replacement of the garage door at an unknown date.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style with Mission Revival influence by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including asymmetrical façades; stucco exterior; flat roof with stepped parapet; fenestration consisting of recessed, multi-lite wood casement and double hung windows; arched accent windows; and entryway highlighted by an arched stucco recess. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 1111 Golden Gate Drive was built by John D. Phelps. Phelps has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 1111 Golden Gate Drive has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - *Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 1111 Golden Gate Drive is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Sherlock Fay House located at 1111 Golden Gate Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style of architecture with Mission Revival style influences. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 5/26/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/26/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Sherlock Fay House** (owned by Alexis and Shawna Volen, 1111 Golden Gate Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **1111 Golden Gate Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **444-135-03-00**, further described as BLK 30 ST & ALLEY CLSD ADJ & POR OF LOTS 1 & 8 & 9 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Sherlock Fay House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style with Mission Revival influence and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1924 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features asymmetrical façades; stucco exterior; flat roof with stepped parapet; fenestration consisting of recessed, multi-lite wood casement and double hung windows; arched accent windows; and entryway highlighted by an arched stucco recess. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney