



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 12, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-029

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of May 26, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – David and Patricia Barron House**

APPLICANT: DASMOD LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 2314 Rue Adriane, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the David and Patricia Barron House located at 2314 Rue Adriane as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the David and Patricia Barron House located at 2314 Rue Adriane as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1961 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 221 square foot addition set to the side of the garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Neoclassical Styled Ranch architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a main center mass flanked by two smaller wing masses with off-set rooflines; moderately pitched, side gabled roofs with wide shiplap boards in the gable ends; brick veneer over wood framing; a full-width porch supported by large fluted, round Doric columns; an entry door with classical decorative surround; decorative wood shutters; and varied fenestration consisting of full-height 12-over-12 double hung wood frame and sash windows, 9-over-9 and 6-over-6 double hung wood frame and sash windows, and single-lite fixed and casement aluminum frame and sash windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The building is located on APN 352-321-17-00 in the residential subdivision of Chateau Ville. The property was located within the boundary of the 2004 Draft La Jolla Survey, but was not identified in the survey because the survey did not include post-1960s buildings.

The historic name of the resource, the David and Patricia Barron House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the owners who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Brian F. Smith and Associates which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees, and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 2314 Rue Adriane did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or La Jolla's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 2314 Rue Adriane did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building located at 2314 Rue Adriane was designed by architect Frank R. Schwarzkopf and built by contractor Phillip J. Maynard in 1961 and reflects Neoclassical Styled Ranch architecture. The building features three main masses – a main center mass flanked by two smaller wing masses with off-set rooflines. All roofs are moderately pitched and side gabled with flat tile roofing and wide shiplap boards in the gable end, and the frame façade is clad in brick veneer. The roof of the main, symmetrical center mass extends out past the building wall to support a full-width porch supported by large fluted, round Doric columns. The entry door is with classical decorative surround is centered on the mass and flanked by full-height 12-over-12 double hung wood frame and sash windows with decorative shutters. The wing to the left of the center mass features a pair of 9-over-9 and a pair of 6-over-6 double hung wood frame and sash windows, both with decorative shutters. The wing to the right of the center mass features a pair of 6-over-6 double hung wood frame and sash windows with decorative shutters and an attached 2-car garage with a wood tilt-up door.

The applicant's Historical Resource Research Report notes several modifications, some of which are clearly documented, and others which are not. In 1994 a 221 square foot addition was added to the side of the garage toward the rear, largely outside of any public view. The report also notes replacement of two windows and one set of doors within the original openings on the rear façade,

based on a comparison of the existing condition to the original plans. The two windows are distinct from all other aluminum-frame fixed and casement windows remaining on the house. The plans call for sliding doors where French doors are currently present on the rear façade. It is assumed in the report that this is a modification. Lastly, the report also states that the brick veneer across the back of the house was added sometime after construction was completed. However, this assertion is not clearly supported by the record, which includes two sets of plans that appear to date to the original construction. One set identifies the material at the rear façade as stucco, and the second set includes a hand-written note across the rear façade which says, "Brick". Therefore, it appears likely that the use of a brick veneer at the rear façade was a change made during construction. Field changes are also evident in the lack of sidelights at the front door, which are shown in the plans but are not present, with no scarring or patching visible in the brick façade. It is unknown whether the pointed cupola shown on the plans above the garage was ever constructed. The only documented modifications – the 1994 addition and the replacement of two windows and a door in the original openings at the rear – do not significantly impair the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling, nor would these aspects of integrity be significantly impaired if the building had been constructed with a cupola which is no longer present. Therefore, the building retains integrity to convey significance under HRB Criterion C.

According to Virginia Savage McAlester in the 2013 edition of *A Field Guide to American Houses*, Styled Ranch houses were built intermittently during the Ranch-house era (1935 - c.1975), but they became increasingly common during the 1970s and dominated new one-story homes in the 1980s. Standard Ranch houses frequently incorporate one or more common historic elements – shutters, wrought iron, paneled doors – because lending institutions felt comfortable with the traditional feeling these details impart. What sets a Styled Ranch apart is the presence of a more complete and unified set of stylistic details that spell out a distinct style. Five main styles are common: Spanish, French, Tudor, Colonial Revival and Neoclassical. All of these styles have features similar to those found on the Eclectic versions of each style but were adapted to a wide, low, one-story form. The Neoclassical Ranch is a less common subtype found more often in southern states, and is characterized by a one-story porch supported by classical columns. The porch may be present only at the entry (entry porch) or extend the full width of the house. Generally there is a symmetrical main block. Often clad in brick, it is sometimes also accompanied by sections of wood frame. Traditional multi-pane windows are typically used, and roof dormers may be present.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of Neoclassical Styled Ranch architecture by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a main center mass flanked by two smaller wing masses with off-set rooflines; moderately pitched, side gabled roofs with wide shiplap boards in the gable ends; brick veneer over wood framing; a full-width porch supported by large fluted, round Doric columns; an entry door with classical decorative surround; decorative wood shutters; and varied fenestration consisting of full-height 12-over-12 double hung wood frame and sash windows, 9-over-9 and 6-over-6 double hung wood frame and sash windows, and single-lite fixed and casement aluminum frame and sash windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - *Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.*

The subject property at 2314 Rue Adriane was designed by architect Frank R. Schwarzkopf and built by contractor Phillip J. Maynard. Neither Schwarzkopf nor Maynard have been established by the Historical

Resources Board as masters in their respective fields, and there is insufficient information to designate them as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 2314 Rue Adriane has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 2314 Rue Adriane is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the David and Patricia Barron House located at 2314 Rue Adriane be designated with a period of significance of 1961 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Neoclassical Styled Ranch architecture and retains integrity to its period of significance and date of construction. The designation excludes the 221 square foot addition set to the side of the garage. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 5/26/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/26/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **David and Patricia Barron House** (owned by DASMODO LLC, 1650 North Coast Highway 101, Encinitas, CA 92024) located at **2314 Rue Adriane, San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: **352-321-17-00**, further described as LOT 14 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the David and Patricia Barron House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource embodies the distinctive characteristics of Neoclassical Styled Ranch architecture and retains integrity to its 1961 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a main center mass flanked by two smaller wing masses with off-set rooflines; moderately pitched, side gabled roofs with wide shiplap boards in the gable ends; brick veneer over wood framing; a full-width porch supported by large fluted, round Doric columns; an entry door with classical decorative surround; decorative wood shutters; and varied fenestration consisting of full-height 12-over-12 double hung wood frame and sash windows, 9-over-9 and 6-over-6 double hung wood frame and sash windows, and single-lite fixed and casement aluminum frame and sash windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 221 square foot addition set to the side of the garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney