

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	October 13, 2016	REPORT NO. HRB-16-066
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of October 27, 2016	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #6 – Gersom Kruse and Louis Kruse House	
APPLICANT:	Dente Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian	
LOCATION:	2740 Granada Avenue, 92104, Greater North P	ark Community, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Gersom Krus located at 2740 Granada Avenue as a historic	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Gersom Kruse and the Louis Kruse House located at 2740 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage constructed in 1988. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of a Craftsman style house and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its two-story form with a gable roof, exposed rafter ends and knee braces, exterior sheathed with wood shingles and stucco, wood windows, and a side entrance porch.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the South Park neighborhood in a predominantly single family home area.

The nomination was previously distributed to the HRB for the July meeting. Due to the modern stucco texture on the first floor of the house, staff was not recommending designation (Attachment 2). The applicant requested a continuance to address the issue. With the guidance of staff, the applicant submitted for and received a permit for the reapplication of the stucco with a historically appropriate finish.

The building is located on APN 453-631-15-00. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Gersom Kruse and the Louis Kruse House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of brothers who constructed the house as their personal residence. <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1912 and designed in the Craftsman style, the house features a two story mass with a gable roof sheathed with asphalt shingles running east to west. The exterior of the house is sheathed with stucco on the 1st floor and wood shingles on the second floor which flair out slightly at the lower corners. The eave features exposed rafter ends with a narrow beam under the rafters running the length of the eave and decorative knee braces under the beam. Fenestration consists predominantly of fixed and casement divided light wood windows. Windows on the first floor at the south and east facades feature leaded glass while windows at the second floor feature an "X" pattern on the upper third of the window. The front entrance is located on the south side of the house. The entrance is accessed via a raised and squared off stucco porch that is located just behind the chimney. Above the porch is a wood pergola covering the second floor balcony with a low wood rail on top of the stucco wall. The two car garage is accessed via a driveway located on the south side of the property.

There have been a number of changes to the property. A significant modification that has been recently addressed was the application of non historic stucco texture on the first floor and the front porch area. The property owner redid the stucco recently with a texture that is similar to the original finish. The stucco was also painted similar to the historic finish. The second floor shingles were also replaced, but it is unclear if the pattern or style of shingles were matched with the replacement shingles. Additionally, a wood railing and a pergola were added to the second floor of the front porch. In 1988, the original garage was removed and a two car garage was added at the southwest corner of the property. Despite the modifications, the property has retained it integrity.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties. <u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including its two-story form with a gable roof, exposed rafter ends and knee braces, exterior sheathed with wood shingles and stucco, wood windows, and a side entrance porch.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Gersom Kruse and the Louis Kruse House located at 2740 Granada Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Craftsman style house. The designation excludes the detached garage constructed in 1988. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner

JB/ks

Attachment(s):

Hame

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. HRB Staff Report dated July 14, 2016
- 3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover
- 4. Addendum to the Historical Report dated October 2016

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 10/27/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/27/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Gersom Kruse and Louis Kruse House** (owned by Dente Family Trust 05-19-15, 2740 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **2740 Granada Avenue**, **San Diego**, **CA 92104**, APN: **453-631-15-00**, further described as BLK 5 LOTS 33 & 34 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Gersom Kruse and Louis Kruse House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of a Craftsman style house and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its two-story form with a gable roof, exposed rafter ends and knee braces, exterior sheathed with wood shingles and stucco, wood windows, and a side entrance porch. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear detached garage constructed in 1988.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

COURTNEY ANN COYLE, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	July 14, 2016	REPORT NO. HRB-16-041
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of July 28, 2016	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #7 – 2740 Granada Avenue	
APPLICANT:	Dente Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian	
LOCATION:	2740 Granada Avenue, 92104, Greater North Pa	ark Community, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the property loca a historical resource.	ated at 2740 Granada Avenue as

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 2740 Granada Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the South Park neighborhood in a predominantly single family home area.

The building is located on APN 453-631-15-00. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff believes that the site is not significant due to the modifications to the house that have adversely impacted the character defining features. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1912 and designed in the Craftsman style, the house features a two story mass with a gable roof sheathed with asphalt shingles running east to west. The exterior of the house is sheathed with stucco on the 1st floor and wood shingles on the second floor which flair out slightly at the lower corners. The eave features exposed rafter ends with a narrow beam under the rafters running the length of the eave and decorative knee braces under the beam. Fenestration consists predominantly of fixed and casement divided light wood windows. Windows on the first floor at the south and east facades feature leaded glass while windows at the second floor feature an "X" pattern on the upper third of the window. The front entrance is located on the south side of the house. The entrance is accessed via a raised and squared off stucco porch that is located just behind the chimney. Above the porch is a wood pergola covering the second floor balcony with a low wood rail on top of the stucco wall. The two car garage is accessed via a driveway located on the south side of the property.

There have been a number of changes to the property that have negatively impacted the characterdefining features of the house. A significant modification has been the application of the nonhistoric stucco finish to the first floor, including the front porch, of the house. The second floor shingles were also replaced, but it is unclear if the pattern or style of shingles were matched with the replacement shingles. Additionally, a wood railing and a pergola were added to the second floor of the front porch. In 1988, the original garage was removed and a two car garage was added at the southwest corner of the property.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

The cumulative modifications to the building, including the non-historic stucco texture, the wood shingle siding replacement and the addition of the pergola and wood rail at the 2nd of the front porch, have significantly impaired the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling to the point that the building is no longer eligible under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is not recommended that the 2740 Granada Avenue be designated under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/ks

Attachment(s):

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover