



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 3, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-074

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of November 17, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House**

APPLICANT: Donald and Maribeth Shanahan represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 3211 Trumbull Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House located at 3211 Trumbull Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House located at 3211 Trumbull Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1932 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Pueblo Revival architecture and retains integrity to its 1932 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a flat roof with simple parapet; stucco over wood frame construction; round pipe vents; small and large rectangular vigas in various concentrations around the façade; and fenestration consisting of fixed and 1-over-1 double hung wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is a one and two story single family home located on APN 531-240-10-00, on a sloping lot in the residential subdivision of Cabrillo Terrace. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the first owners, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 3211 Trumbull Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Peninsula's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 3211 Trumbull Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building located at 3211 Trumbull Street is a one and two story single family home constructed in 1932 in the Pueblo Revival style and features a flat roof with simple parapet; stucco over wood frame construction on a concrete foundation; round pipe vents; and small and large rectangular vigas in various concentrations around the façade. The two-car garage is set into the sloping lot, and a set of on-grade stairs lead from the side of the garage up to the roof of the garage, which is level with the first floor of the house. The entry door is set in a three-sided projecting bay with second floor balcony above. To the left of the entry is a one story projecting bay with a large tripartite window consisting of a wide single fixed pane flanked by 1-over-1 double hung wood windows. Remaining fenestration consists primarily of 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows, maintaining the clean simplicity of the Pueblo Revival style.

Modifications include the replacement of the windows in-kind within the original openings; replacement of original doors within the original openings, although the appearance of the entry door and the door leading to the balcony is different; replacement of the iron railing at the second floor above the entry with a simple railing that meets current code requirements for height; replacement of the wrought iron accents with new accents with a slightly differing design; construction of an outdoor fireplace; and alteration of the garage door from two bays separated by a post to a single large bay. Overall, the modifications do not impact the building's design, materials, workmanship and feeling to the extent that the building no longer retains integrity under Criterion C.

Pueblo Revival design cues draw on local historical precedents and are intended to evoke the hand finished construction of traditional Native American architecture found in the American Southwest. The style was employed primarily in southwestern states in the 1920s and 1930s, particularly in New

Mexico and Arizona. A number of Pueblo Revival style homes were constructed in the San Diego area in the 1920s, however many of them have either been demolished or significantly altered over time to reflect more Spanish Eclectic designs. Character defining features of the style typically include flat roofs with parapets, irregular stucco finishes, rounded wall surfaces, and rough-hewn vigas, window lintels and porch supports.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Pueblo Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a flat roof with simple parapet; stucco over wood frame construction; round pipe vents; small and large rectangular vigas in various concentrations around the façade; and fenestration consisting of fixed and 1-over-1 double hung wood windows. Therefore, staff recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 3211 Trumbull Street was designed by architects Gustavas Hanssen and Robert Halley, Jr. and was built by Harry Muns, none of whom have been established by the HRB as Masters in their respective fields. The applicant's report recommends that Hanssen and Halley be established as Master Architects, and that the subject house be designated under HRB Criterion D as a notable example of their work.

Hanssen was born in 1869 and came to San Diego in 1910, where he became an original member of the San Diego Association of Architects, the precursor to the San Diego Chapter of the American Institute of Architects. In May of the same year, he was issued a certificate to practice architecture by the State Board of Architects. He designed a number of large and small projects in a variety of architectural styles including Mission Revival, Pueblo Revival, Arts and Crafts, Prairie, Italian Renaissance Revival, and Deco/Art Moderne. A number of his projects are profiled in newspaper articles included in Attachment E.4 of the applicant's report, and at least three of his buildings have been previously designated by the HRB.

Halley was born in 1879 and moved to San Diego in the early 1900s. In 1910 he began working as an architect and also became an original member of the San Diego Association of Architects. Halley's work was often mid-to-large scale. Documentation regarding his work is more limited, and to date no known resources attributed to him have been designated by the HRB. Hanssen and Halley worked together as partners from 1931-1935, toward the end of their careers.

While Hanssen in particular does appear to have been a well-known and well-regarded architect who designed a number of large commissions of high quality, the applicant's report does not present a clear discussion of his overall body of work, what characterized it, why he should be regarded as a Master Architect, and how the subject property represents his notable work. Instead, the report provides brief biographical information and a collection of period articles documenting his work. Without a clear and compelling statement of significance, staff is unable to support the establishment of Hanssen as a Master, although his eligibility does appear likely. Similarly, there is insufficient information and analysis to support the establishment of Halley as a Master Architect. Lastly, the subject property is attributed to the firm of Hanssen and Halley, with no indication as to which architect may have been responsible for the design. If both Hanssen and Halley are established as Masters at some point in the future, then the subject building could be eligible under Criterion D for its association with both Masters. If additional analysis reveals that only Hanssen is

eligible as a Master Architect, there would need to be adequate documentation to credit the design to him. Therefore, based upon the information and analysis provided, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D at this time.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 3211 Trumbull Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 3211 Trumbull Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House located at 3211 Trumbull Street be designated with a period of significance of 1932 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Pueblo Revival architecture. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/17/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/17/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House** (owned by Donald and Maribeth Shanahan, 3211 Trumbull Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3211 Trumbull Street, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **531-240-10-00**, further described as BLK C LOT 27 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Pueblo Revival style and retains integrity to its 1932 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a flat roof with simple parapet; stucco over wood frame construction; round pipe vents; small and large rectangular vigas in various concentrations around the façade; and fenestration consisting of fixed and 1-over-1 double hung wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
COURTNEY ANN COYLE, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney