



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 3, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-073

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of November 17, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – Horace and Kate Iliff House**

APPLICANT: Louise A. Rehling Revocable Trust; represented by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea

LOCATION: 3510 Park Boulevard, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Horace and Kate Iliff House located at 3510 Park Boulevard as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Horace and Kate Iliff House located at 3510 Park Boulevard as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays a multi-plane gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang, exposed roof rafters, nearly full width porch with tapered columns, wood cladding, wood frame windows as well as decorative beams and attic vents.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one story, single-family residence constructed in 1923 in the Craftsman Style. The building sits on an interior lot with its primary façade facing Park Boulevard.

The building is located on APN 452-363-28-00. The property was identified in the 2015 Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5D3, which means the property "appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Horace and Kate Iliff House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Horace and Kate Iliff, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 3510 Park Boulevard did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Uptown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 3510 Park Boulevard did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one story, single-family residence constructed in 1923 in the Craftsman Style. The house sits on an interior lot with its primary façade facing Park Boulevard. A scored concrete walkway leads from the street to the house's partially covered concrete front porch. Above the windowsill line the house is clad in redwood shiplap siding with wood shingles below. The house features a front facing triple gable roof with wide, overhanging eaves. The roofline also features a flared bargeboard, exposed rafters and decorative beams. Beneath the apex of the largest two gables are decorative attic vents. Two window bays project from the house; one on the north elevation and a larger rounded one on the south elevation near the driveway. A brick chimney appears on the north façade. The original garage; designed in a similar fashion to the house with shiplap siding and a gable roof with overhanging eaves and exposed rafters; is present at the rear of the house.

The smallest gable forms the roof of the front porch and is supported by tapered Tuscan columns. The L shaped porch extends almost the entire width of the front façade and wraps around to the south elevation where there is a secondary entrance. The house retains its original wooden front door with beveled glass window. Two six-over-one fixed pane wood focal windows flank the front door on the primary façade. A similar five-over-one fixed pane wood window flanked by two double

hung windows appears on the front portion of the south façade. The rest of the house features mostly one-over-one wood double hung sash windows. A six-over-six double hung window and a three-over-three fixed window appear on the rear façade.

While conducting a site visit, staff had concerns that the portion of the porch on the south elevation may be an addition. Staff noted that the concrete squares on the floor in this area were a different size than the front section of the porch. Also, staff noticed cracking on the stem wall that may indicate a seam where the newer and older sections may meet. Additionally, it is known that the iron fence surrounding the porch is not original. While staff has suspicions that the southern portion of the porch may be a later addition there is no documentation to confirm that it is not original to the house.

Several other modifications have been made to the house since its construction. The glass in the round bay on the driveway façade was replaced in 1950 when damage was done to the windows by an exploding car. Additionally, the garage's original doors have been replaced at some point. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials or feeling.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman Style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a multi-plane gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang, exposed roof rafters, nearly full width porch with tapered columns, wood cladding, wood frame windows as well as decorative beams and attic vents. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 3510 Park Boulevard failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 3510 Park Boulevard has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 3510 Park Boulevard is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Horace and Kate Iliff House located at 3510 Park Boulevard be designated with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman Style. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Suzanne Segur
Assistant Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

SS/ks

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/17/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/17/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Horace and Kate Iliff House** (owned by Louise A. Rehling Revocable Trust 06-09-11, 3510 Park Boulevard, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3510 Park Boulevard, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-363-28-00**, further described as BLK 244 POR in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Horace and Kate Iliff House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Style and retains integrity to its 1923 period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays a multi-plane gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang, exposed roof rafters, nearly full width porch with tapered columns, wood cladding, wood frame windows as well as decorative beams and attic vents. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
COURTNEY ANN COYLE, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney