



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 3, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-076

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of November 17, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Charles and Anna Stark House**

APPLICANT: Sparks Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4641 Vista Street, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Charles and Anna Stark House located at 4641 Vista Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Charles and Anna Stark House located at 4641 Vista Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. An interior element included in the designation is the original living room split-face brick fireplace. The designation excludes the rear addition to the detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a hipped, shed and gabled roof of Mission clay tile set in front of a flat roof with decorative curved parapet; a slight coved eave detail; stucco cladding; arched accent windows; arched, inset entry porch; multi-lite wood main entry door and French door set with sidelights; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite wood double hung windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-story single-family residence built in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic style on the east side of Vista Street between Adams Avenue and Madison Avenue in the Kensington Park Annex of the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The building is located on APN 465-344-08-00. The property was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey and given a Status Code of 5D2, "Contributor to a district that is eligible for local listing or designation."

The historic name of the resource, the Charles and Anna Stark House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Charles and Anna Stark, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4641 Vista Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Kensington-Talmadge's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4641 Vista Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story single-family residence with detached garage built in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The building is of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation and maintains an original rectangular plan form sited on a flat rectangular lot in the Kensington Park Annex. The roof form is predominantly flat, with a combination of hipped, shed and gabled roof of Mission clay tile at the front. A decorative curved parapet is positioned behind the tiled roof. A very slight covered eave detail is present with little to no eave overhang. The building exhibits an asymmetrical primary façade and is clad in moderately textured stucco. An original scored concrete walkway leads to the central inset covered porch with arched stucco accents. An original multi-lite wood entry door and is at the left side of the porch and a multi-lite wood French door and two sidelights mark the center. A small brick patio wall was reconstructed to match the original seen in historic photos, as noted in the applicant's report. Fenestration is primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood double hung windows.

A projecting wing is present to the left of the inset entry and features a massive arched picture window flanked by a pair of 3-over-1 double hung windows. A front gabled wing to the right of the entry is similarly treated with an arched tripartite window set and a decorative louvered attic vent matching the style of those seen elsewhere on the house. An exterior stucco-clad chimney is present

on the north side elevation and is flanked by a pair of stained glass windows. An interior feature also proposed for designation is the living room fireplace with an original split-face brick design. At the end of the concrete driveway, a detached garage is at the rear of the property and features a triangular-shaped front parapet and matches Sanborn maps and historic photos provided in the report. The garage has been modified with a replacement garage door and a rear shed-roofed addition.

As noted in the applicant's report and as seen by the historic and transitional photos of the property, a number of previously modified features, including multi-lite windows, roof tile and brick patio wall, have been carefully restored to match the original. As for remaining alterations, it appears that three decorative wall reliefs, formerly located at the center of the front parapet wall and over the tripartite window set to the right of the entry, were removed sometime prior to the 1950s. Overall, this modification has not significantly impacted integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling to the extent that the building no longer conveys its original 1926 design and period of significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a hipped, shed and gabled roof of Mission clay tile set in front of a flat roof with decorative curved parapet; a slight coved eave detail; stucco cladding; arched accent windows; arched, inset entry porch; multi-lite wood main entry door and French door set with sidelights; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite wood double hung windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C, including the living room fireplace with split-face brick.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

According to the Notice of Completion, the subject property at 4641 Vista Street was built by under contract with Robert H. Winn Company, Charles R. McCormick Lumber Company, William Darby Company, Charles L. Wigg, J.S. Schirm, H.G. Archibald, and B.H. Davis. None of these individuals or businesses has been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate any as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4641 Vista Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4641 Vista Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Charles and Anna Stark House located at 4641 Vista Street be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. An interior element included in the designation is the original living room split-face brick fireplace. The designation excludes the rear addition to the detached garage. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Interior fireplace proposed for designation
3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/17/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/17/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Charles and Anna Stark House** (owned by Sparks Family Trust 08-20-13, 4641 Vista Street, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4641 Vista Street, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **465-344-08-00**, further described as BLK D LOT 8 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Charles and Anna Stark House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a hipped, shed and gabled roof of Mission clay tile set in front of a flat roof with decorative curved parapet; a slight coved eave detail; stucco cladding; arched accent windows; arched, inset entry porch; multi-lite wood main entry door and French door set with sidelights; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite wood double hung windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the original living room split-face brick fireplace.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear addition to the detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
COURTNEY ANN COYLE, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney

Site Plan with Footprint/Interior Plan

Split-face brick fireplace included in proposed designation

