



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 12, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-028

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of May 26, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – Louis Buray Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Janet Heydt represented by Edith Salas

OWNER: Christa B. Kriebal Trust

LOCATION: 552 Rushville Street, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Louis Buray Spec House #1 located at 552 Rushville Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Louis Buray Spec House #1 located at 552 Rushville Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, with its varied roof forms and unusual detailing, the resource embodies the “eclectic” in Spanish Eclectic architecture and continues to convey the historic significance of the by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including articulated massing; gable, shed and pyramidal clay tile roofs, as well as flat roof with simple parapets; a stucco chimney with arched spark arrestor; clay pipe attic vents; stucco over wood frame construction; stucco buttresses at the sides of the house; an entry courtyard enclosed by a low stucco wall; an arched wood entry door set in a rounded turret with a pyramidal roof; 3-lite steel frame and sash casement windows in various configurations, some with multi-lite uppers; and decorative stucco foundation vents.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The building is located on APN 351-151-20-00 in the

residential subdivision of La Jolla Crest. The property was identified in the 2004 Draft La Jolla Survey and given a Status Code of 7R, "Identified in a Reconnaissance Level Survey: Not Evaluated." When assigning status codes for the Survey, individual resources identified in the reconnaissance survey that were not identified as a potential contributor to a potential historic district were given a Status Code of "7R" since those resources were not evaluated for integrity under the reconnaissance level survey.

The historic name of the resource, the Louis Buray Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of owner/builder Louis Buray, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Edith Salas, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees, and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 552 Rushville Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or La Jolla's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 552 Rushville Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property located at 552 Rushville Street is a single family home constructed in 1928 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features gable, shed and pyramidal clay tile roofs, as well as flat roof with simple parapets; stucco over wood frame construction; stucco buttresses at the sides of the house; and a raised foundation with concrete footings and floor joists. The house is characterized by articulated massing with varied roof forms and unusual detailing, and features an entry courtyard enclosed by a low stucco wall. The main entry features an arched wood door set in a rounded turret with a pyramidal roof, clay tile pipe vents, and an unusual faux window recess with sill near the roofline. To the left of the entry, a shed roof massing projects out toward the street, and includes a triangular grouping of three round pipe vents, a pair of 3-lite steel frame and sash windows, and a single 3-lite steel frame and sash window with arched upper and a projecting arched stucco sill.

Decorative foundation vents are present below. To the right of the entry is another massing which projects out slightly toward the street. This massing includes an asymmetrical front-gable roof, a triangular grouping of three round pipe vents, and a window consisting of 3-lite steel frame and sash casement windows flanking a fixed 3-lite window, all under a 10-lite arched fixed steel frame window. This massing is connected to the turret massing by a yet another massing with a steeply pitched, side-gable clay tile roof. A chimney with an arched stucco spark arrestor is located on the back-side of the steep gable. Remaining fenestration consists primarily of single and paired 3-lite steel frame and sash casement windows, some with fixed uppers. A detached single-car garage with a shed roof is set at the rear of the lot.

Modifications are minimal, and include replacement of the front door in the original opening; replacement of one window on the west elevation with a vinyl sliding window, the addition of tile at the entry steps, and possible in-kind replacement of at least some roofing tile. The modifications do not have significant impacts to integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling, and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: With its varied roof forms and unusual detailing, the property at 552 Rushville Street embodies the “eclectic” in Spanish Eclectic architecture and continues to convey the historic significance of the by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including articulated massing; gable, shed and pyramidal clay tile roofs, as well as flat roof with simple parapets; a stucco chimney with arched spark arrestor; clay pipe attic vents; stucco over wood frame construction; stucco buttresses at the sides of the house; an entry courtyard enclosed by a low stucco wall; an arched wood entry door set in a rounded turret with a pyramidal roof; 3-lite steel frame and sash casement windows in various configurations, some with multi-lite uppers; and decorative stucco foundation vents. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 552 Rushville Street was built by Louis Buray. Buray has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - *Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The property at 552 Rushville Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - *Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 552 Rushville Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Louis Buray Spec House #1 located at 552 Rushville Street be designated with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic architecture retaining integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

ADOPTED ON 5/26/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/26/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **LOUIS BURAY SPEC HOUSE #1** (owned by Christa B. Kriebal Trust, 904 Sandpiper Place, San Diego, CA 92037) located at **552 Rushville Street, San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: **351-151-20-00**, further described as LOT 22 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Louis Buray Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains integrity to its 1928 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, with its varied roof forms and unusual detailing, the resource embodies the "eclectic" in Spanish Eclectic architecture and continues to convey the historic significance of the by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including articulated massing; gable, shed and pyramidal clay tile roofs, as well as flat roof with simple parapets; a stucco chimney with arched spark arrestor; clay pipe attic vents; stucco over wood frame construction; stucco buttresses at the sides of the house; an entry courtyard enclosed by a low stucco wall; an arched wood entry door set in a rounded turret with a pyramidal roof; 3-lite steel frame and sash casement windows in various configurations, some with multi-lite uppers; and decorative stucco foundation vents. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney