

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	August 12, 2021	REPORT NO. HRB-21-046
HEARING DATE:	August 26, 2021	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #01 – Fred and Harriet Young Spec House #1	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	abase (CHRID) link
APPLICANT:	Bright Westerman Trust 07-13-18 represented	d by Landmark Historic Preservation
LOCATION:	1907 Granada Avenue, Golden Hill Communit APN 539-212-14-00	zy, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Fred and Har 1907 Granada Avenue as a historical resourc	0

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Fred and Harriet Young Spec House #1 located at 1907 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Mission Revival style with Spanish Eclectic influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a symmetrical front façade with minimal ornamental details, smooth stucco cladding, and a decorative, stepped parapet. Spanish Eclectic influences are visible through the cantilevered covered entryway clad in red clay tiles supported by decorative brackets and large, divided lite and single lite wooden windows and doors.

#### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is located on the east side of Granada Avenue in the Golden Hill neighborhood.

The property was located within the boundary of the <u>2016 Golden Hill Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey</u> but was not identified in the survey because the property was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Fred and Harriet Young Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Fred and Harriet Young, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

### <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

# CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property is a one-story single-family residence with a detached garage constructed in the Mission Revival style with Spanish Eclectic influences. The primary elevation features a smooth textured stucco exterior with a decorative parapet, a centralized scored concrete entry porch covered by a cantilevered awning clad in red clay tiles that is supported by decorative brackets. Fenestration on this elevation includes two exaggerated, divided lite wooden windows and a divided lite entry door. Additional details on the primary elevation include the scarring of three decorative pilaster details above the centralized entrance and a driveway wingwall that matches the decorative parapet. The side elevations feature limited details, but the south elevation features a stuccoed chimney as well as double hung wooden windows in different sizes as well as a ribbon driveway that leads to the original detached garage. The north side elevation features painted clay drains, double hung wooden windows and the continuation of the smooth stucco texture. The rear elevation features a large double hung window, a pair of divided lite French doors, and a divided lite single door that leads to a small rear deck.

Modifications to the site are minimal and include the addition of a rear deck at an unknown date, restuccoing of the chimney with a textured stucco finish at an unknown date, the addition of doors in the driveway wing wall between 2014-2015, and the removal of three circular shaped plaster decals above the entry porch at an unknown date. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

California was the birthplace of the Mission and Mission Revival style and many of its landmark examples are concentrated there. The earliest examples of the style were built in 1890s and by 1900 the style was spreading eastward under the influence of fashionable architects and national builders' magazines. Although never common outside of the southwestern states, scattered examples were built in early 20th -century suburbs throughout the country. Most date from the years between 1905 and 1920. Commonly found features of the Mission Revival style include: Mission-shaped dormer or roof parapet; widely overhanging eaves, usually open; porch roofs supported by large square piers, commonly arched above; wall surfaces usually clad in smooth stucco. The shift from Mission Revival to the Spanish Eclectic style is well established with the design and completion of the Panama California Exposition and public debut in 1915. The Spanish Eclectic style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The Spanish Eclectic style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features of this style include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; decorative windows and other arched openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Mission Revival style with Spanish Eclectic influences by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a symmetrical front façade with minimal ornamental details, smooth stucco cladding, and a decorative, stepped parapet. Spanish Eclectic influences are visible through the cantilevered covered entryway clad in red clay tiles supported by decorative brackets and large, divided lite and single lite wooden windows and doors. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 1907 Granada Avenue did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may can be reevaluated at a future date pending submittal of additional information and analysis.

#### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Fred and Harriet Young Spec House #1 located at 1907 Granada Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C for its association with the Mission Revival style with Spanish Eclectic influences.

Senior Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/26/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/26/2021, to consider the historical designation of the Fred and Harriet Young Spec House #1 (owned by Bright Westerman Trust 07-13-18, 1907 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **1907 Granada Avenue**, **San Diego**, **CA 92102**, APN: **539-212-14-00**, further described as BLK 48 LOT 11 ST CLSD ADJ&W60FT OF LD DAF:S 16FT LOT 10&N22FT OF in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

#### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Fred and Harriet Young Spec House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Mission Revival style with Spanish Eclectic influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a symmetrical front façade with minimal ornamental details, smooth stucco cladding, and a decorative, stepped parapet. Spanish Eclectic influences are visible through the cantilevered covered entryway clad in red clay tiles supported by decorative brackets and large, divided lite and single lite wooden windows and doors. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: \_\_\_\_

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney

# RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

## WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

1907 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92102

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 539-212-14-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

THIS PAGE ADDED TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE SPACE FOR RECORDING INFORMATION (Additional recording fee applies)