

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 14, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-041

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of July 28, 2016

SUBJECT: ITEM #7 - 2740 Granada Avenue

APPLICANT: Dente Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 2740 Granada Avenue, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 2740 Granada Avenue as

a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 2740 Granada Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the South Park neighborhood in a predominantly single family home area.

The building is located on APN 453-631-15-00. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff believes that the site is not significant due to the modifications to the house that have adversely impacted the character defining features. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1912 and designed in the Craftsman style, the house features a two story mass with a gable roof sheathed with asphalt shingles running east to west. The exterior of the house is sheathed with stucco on the 1st floor and wood shingles on the second floor which flair out slightly at the lower corners. The eave features exposed rafter ends with a narrow beam under the rafters running the length of the eave and decorative knee braces under the beam. Fenestration consists predominantly of fixed and casement divided light wood windows. Windows on the first floor at the south and east facades feature leaded glass while windows at the second floor feature an "X" pattern on the upper third of the window. The front entrance is located on the south side of the house. The entrance is accessed via a raised and squared off stucco porch that is located just behind the chimney. Above the porch is a wood pergola covering the second floor balcony with a low wood rail on top of the stucco wall. The two car garage is accessed via a driveway located on the south side of the property.

There have been a number of changes to the property that have negatively impacted the character-defining features of the house. A significant modification has been the application of the non-historic stucco finish to the first floor, including the front porch, of the house. The second floor shingles were also replaced, but it is unclear if the pattern or style of shingles were matched with the replacement shingles. Additionally, a wood railing and a pergola were added to the second floor of the front porch. In 1988, the original garage was removed and a two car garage was added at the southwest corner of the property.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

The cumulative modifications to the building, including the non-historic stucco texture, the wood shingle siding replacement and the addition of the pergola and wood rail at the 2nd of the front porch, have significantly impaired the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling to the point that the building is no longer eligible under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is not recommended that the 2740 Granada Avenue be designated under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner

Kelley Stanco

Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/ks

Attachment(s):

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover