SAN YSIDRO COMMUNITY PLANNING GROUP

NOTICE OF ADJOURNED MEETING

The May 18, 2020 Regular Meeting of the San Ysidro Community Planning Group is ADJOURNED. The next Regular Meeting will be announced later.

All 13 current boardmembers will continue to serve until regular meetings can be resumed and an election by the membership is able to be held, as determined by proper authority. Likewise, officers will continue in their current office. Upon the completion of the election process, 8 newly elected boardmembers and 3 officers will serve out the remainder of a normal term (i.e., Officers to April 2022, Boardmembers to April 2024;). Then the next scheduled election for the remaining 7 seats will be in March 2022.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TERMS EXPIRING MARCH 2020</th>
<th>TERMS EXPIRING MARCH 2022</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Miguel AGUIRRE</td>
<td>Cinnamon CLARK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maritza CHAVARIN</td>
<td>Michael FREEDMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodolfo LOPEZ, JR.</td>
<td>Jennifer GOUDEAU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gregorio ORTIZ</td>
<td>Ben MEZA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adriana ORENDAIN</td>
<td>Alberto PEREZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alfonso REYNOSO</td>
<td>Jason M-b WELLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vacancy</td>
<td>Alfonso ZERMENO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chairman: Michael Freedman (619) 690-3833  
michaelf@cox.net

City Planner: Michael Prinz (619) 533-5931  
MPrinz@sandiego.gov
SAN YSIDRO COMMUNITY PLANNING GROUP
ATTENDANCE RECORD
APRIL 2020 - MARCH 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGUIRRE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAVARIN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLARK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FREEDMAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOUDEAU</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOPEZ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEZA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORENDAIN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORTIZ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEREZ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REYNOSO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WELLS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZERMENO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VACANT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VACANT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CITY COUNCIL POLICY 600-24 & SYCPG BYLAWS REQUIRE THAT A SEAT MUST BE DECLARED VACATED WHEN THERE ARE:

3 CONSECUTIVE ABSENCES, OR
4 TOTAL ABSENCES BETWEEN APRIL 2019 AND MARCH 2020

Note: Adjourned Meetings and Special Meetings are not counted for attendance purposes.
DATE ISSUED: April 30, 2020
REPORT NO. PC-20-018

TO: Planning Commission
FROM: Planning Department
SUBJECT: Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices Initiative

Primary Contact: Julia Chase Phone: (858) 495-4764
Secondary Contact: Leslie Keaveney Phone: (619) 446-5370

Council District(s): Citywide

OVERVIEW:
This action requests a recommendation to approve the Planning Department's Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices initiative.

The Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions initiative proposes amendments to the San Diego Municipal Code (SDMC) to provide incentives to increase housing production and expand the mobility network around transit hubs and existing development. The initiative removes regulatory barriers to housing at all income levels, especially low, very low, and moderate-income households, while investing in neighborhood and mobility amenities, such as recreational opportunities, street trees, linear parks, bicycle facilities, urban plazas, and promenades. These types of investments increase the quality of neighborhoods where new housing is proposed by creating more walkable, bikeable, and enjoyable spaces, which in turn helps the City meet its Climate Action Plan goals. Prioritizing these investments in areas where the investments are needed most are central to the intent behind the Complete Communities initiative.

Complete Communities delivers on the City's vision of creating equitable, healthy, and sustainable neighborhoods that are diverse, walkable, connected, safe, and inclusive. Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices creates incentives to build
homes near transit, provide more mobility alternatives, and enhance quality of life for all residents, regardless of their background and identity. Through thoughtful and inclusive planning, the initiatives set the City on a path to create a healthy environment and thriving communities. The Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices initiative implements the City’s Climate Action Plan (CAP) through sustainable land use and transportation planning by building complete communities where people can easily access work, shopping, and recreation by walking, biking, or taking transit, resulting in Citywide reductions to vehicle miles traveled (VMT) therefore resulting in greenhouse gas emissions reductions and improved air quality.

A Draft Environmental Impact Report for Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions, Report SCH No. 2006091032, has been prepared. The public review comment period ended on March 12, 2020, and the Planning Department has prepared responses to the comments received which are included in a Final EIR.

PROPOSED ACTIONS:

RECOMMEND CERTIFICATION of the Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices Final Environmental Impact Report, SCH No. 2019060003.


RECOMMEND ADOPTION of an ordinance adding new Mobility Choices Regulations, in new Division 11 in Chapter 14, Article 3 of the San Diego Municipal Code.

RECOMMEND ADOPTION of a resolution approving a new Active Transportation In Lieu Fee to offset project VMT to fund active transportation projects that reduce VMT within the City’s most VMT efficient areas.

RECOMMEND ADOPTION of an ordinance adding new Housing Solutions Regulations, in new Division 10 in Chapter 14, Article 3 of the San Diego Municipal Code.

RECOMMEND ADOPTION of a resolution approving a new Neighborhood Enhancement fee to be used to fund active transportation and neighborhood amenities within the City’s Transit Priority Areas (TPAs).

DISCUSSION:

A. What is Complete Communities?
Complete Communities is a multifaceted initiative aimed to facilitate equitable, healthy, and sustainable neighborhoods across San Diego. It will help shape a future that works for all San Diegans with a focus on four key areas: housing, mobility, parks, and infrastructure. Complete Communities includes planning strategies that work together to create incentives to build homes near transit, offer more mobility choices, and provide new opportunities for people to walk, bike, relax, and play. These efforts will provide all residents access to the resources and opportunities necessary to improve the quality of their lives. These thoughtful and inclusive planning initiatives and programs will create a healthy environment and thriving communities that will serve to enhance the quality of life for all residents, regardless of their background and identity.

Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions go hand in hand; providing more needed housing options can only achieve the City's climate goals if the housing options have access to mobility choices. The initiative as a whole is detailed in this Section A, while the particular details regarding Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions follow in Sections B and C.

A.1 **How will State legislation be tailored to meet San Diego's needs?**

Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices aligns with the legislative requirements of SB 375 and SB 743, helps the City meet its Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) targets for affordable housing, carries out key components of AB 2372, the California Sustainable and Affordable Housing Act (CASA), and AB 1763, and implements the City's Climate Action Plan (CAP). While aligning with State requirements, Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices ensures a tailored initiative that works for San Diego based on local conditions and public input. This will ensure not only that housing is produced and Citywide VMT is reduced, but also ensure that those goals are achieved by investing equitably across the City.

A.2 **How will Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions help San Diego achieve its climate goals?**

The CAP, adopted in 2015, is a fundamental citywide plan to achieve greenhouse gas (GHG) reductions through local policy and action. CAP implementation is dependent upon adoption of additional ordinances, policies, and programs to implement the strategies and goals set forth in the CAP. The CAP identifies five primary strategies that collectively will meet State GHG reduction targets. With respect to housing and mobility, CAP Strategy 3 identifies that the greatest greenhouse gas emissions reductions can be achieved by strategic land use planning, specifically by locating most of the City’s new housing within TPAs.
Locating housing in areas near transit is one of the City's greatest greenhouse gas emissions reduction strategies. This is because housing located near transit, that is also bikeable and walkable to work, shopping, and recreation results in less vehicle miles traveled. Ensuring mobility options for new housing targeted for these transit areas is crucial to the success of any housing incentive program in terms of the City's achieving its climate goals.

This is why the initiative focuses on investments in the City's VMT efficient areas – mainly TPAs, and communities that are most likely to become TPAs in the future. Recognizing that the City is a large jurisdiction, and using data informed analysis, Complete Communities identifies the locations for the greatest potential for housing that also results in the highest achievement of Citywide climate goals. These zones are targeted for the greatest investments in mobility infrastructure because these are the zones where the need will be greatest, and where the City's investments will have the greatest payouts in terms of climate goals achievements.

A.3 How will Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices help invest equitably in San Diego's neighborhoods?

Complete Communities recognizes that San Diego must grow sustainably and equitably across transportation, recreation, housing, and the economy. Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions will create sustainable and equitable growth by prioritizing equitable development, investing in our communities of concern, and by promoting balanced communities. This initiative provides greater jobs-housing balance, creates more walkable and transit-oriented communities, provides more housing capacity for all income levels, and provides more transportation options for San Diegans beyond the single occupancy vehicle.

Using the Climate Equity Index developed by the City in partnership with the Sustainability Department and the Equity Stakeholder Working Group, this initiative focuses investment in the City's Communities of Concern. Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices maps align investments with the City's Communities of Concern and will provide neighborhood and mobility amenities and active transportation infrastructure that enhance community safety and quality of life. These neighborhood and mobility amenities, such as shade trees, pedestrian resting stops, upgraded bicycle infrastructure, linear parks, traffic calming measures, urban plazas, high visibility crosswalks, recreational opportunities, and cultural facilities, will serve residents all across the City.

Implementation of Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions will mean a variety of housing opportunities, cleaner air, safer streets, more vibrant neighborhoods, enhanced economic opportunities,
for all San Diegans, regardless of location, background, or identity. Prioritized investments in Communities of Concern in general also tends to result in the greatest GHG emissions. See Attachment A, which identifies the City’s Communities of Concern, and shows how those areas align with the City’s transit priority areas, where investments are focused.

B. What is Mobility Choices?

Mobility Choices aims to connect every San Diegan with safe and convenient mobility alternatives that can reliably connect them to jobs, shopping, services, neighborhood parks, open spaces, and other amenities. Mobility Choices supports implementation of Senate Bill 743 by reducing vehicle miles traveled (VMT) through supporting infill development and by increasing transportation and transit options for San Diegans to have greater choices in how they commute and recreate. Mobility Choices supports implementation of the Climate Action Plan by strategically planning and implementing the mobility network around transit hubs and existing development, to reduce vehicle miles traveled and promote more active modes of transportation. An enhanced mobility network provides more options for San Diegans to commute and recreate, promotes a healthier lifestyle, means less congested roads, and a cleaner San Diego for all.

The Mobility Choices package includes the Mobility Choices Regulation Ordinance (Attachment B), Active Transportation In-Lieu Fee (Attachment C), and the following amendments to the Land Development Manual: an updated Appendix A: CEQA Significance Determination Threshold for Transportation (Attachment D), a new Appendix R: Transportation Study Manual (Attachment E), and a new Appendix S: Mobility Choices Implementation Guidelines (Attachment F). See Attachment G: Resolution to Amend the Land Development Manual. Each item is described in further detail below. Mobility Choices does not replace or offset the Development Impact Fee (DIF) Program.

B.1 What is Senate Bill 743 and what does it mandate for the City of San Diego?

In 2013, the State adopted Senate Bill (SB) 743, a bill that fundamentally changes transportation impact analysis as part of California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) compliance. SB 743 is intended to ensure that the environmental impacts of traffic, such as noise, air pollution, and safety concerns, continue to be properly addressed and mitigated through the California Environmental Quality Act, and to more appropriately balance the needs of congestion management with statewide goals related to infill development, promotion of public health through active transportation, and reduction of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions.
The changes required under SB 743 include elimination of auto delay, level of service (LOS), and other similar measures of vehicular capacity or traffic congestion as a basis for determining significant impacts, and instead using Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) as the preferred CEQA transportation metric. VMT is the number of trips multiplied by the trip length. SB 743 requires the selection of a VMT analysis methodology, establishment of VMT thresholds for transportation impacts, and identification of feasible mitigation strategies. Lead agencies, such as the City of San Diego, are required to adopt a new threshold by July 1, 2020. Implementation of SB 743 also implements the City’s Climate Action Plan, which identifies an increase in pedestrian, bicycle, and transit mode shares to reduce VMT and therefore to reduce GHG emissions.

**B.2 What changes would be made to the CEQA Significance Determination Threshold for Traffic, Appendix A of the Land Development Manual?**

As part of the SB 743 mandate, the City’s CEQA Significance Determination Thresholds are proposed to be updated to comply with the change from Level of Service to VMT as the metric for measuring transportation impacts. Section O of the City’s CEQA Significance Determination Thresholds was updated to include thresholds that account for increases in VMT, consider any conflicts with existing City plans or policies relations to the transportation network, and maintain safety and necessary emergency access. Section O(b) refers to the Transportation Study Manual, Appendix S of the Land Development Manual to identify project-specific VMT thresholds. Changing to this new VMT threshold allows the City to address transportation impacts by focusing mitigation efforts toward reducing vehicular travel, rather than accommodating additional vehicular trips under the prior level of service metric, consistent with the City’s Climate Action Plan.

**B.3 What are some of the significant updates included in the Transportation Study Manual, Appendix S of the Land Development Manual?**

As part of the SB 743 mandate, the Transportation Study Manual (TSM) is a proposed update to the City’s current Transportation Impact Study Manual, last updated in 1998. Consistent with the intent of SB 743, the TSM provides detailed CEQA transportation analysis guidelines using VMT based metrics to determine a development’s environmental impacts. Additionally, the TSM ensures that best planning practices for a development are incorporated through a Local Mobility Analysis (LMA). The LMA evaluates the effects of a development on mobility, access, circulation, and related safety elements in the proximate area of the development for all modes. The LMA includes guidance for analyzing and accommodating non-single occupancy modes: pedestrian, cyclists, and transit, which were not previously included in the 1998 guidelines. Aligned with SB 743, the TSM focuses on VMT reducing measures.
Vehicular accommodating measures are not required for new development unless they are VMT reducing.

**B.4 What does the Mobility Choices Regulation Ordinance require?**

In order to ensure that the City's significance threshold under SB 743 ensures that the City will achieve overall Citywide reductions in VMT, to meet CAP goals, the Mobility Choices Regulations will require new development within the City to either provide VMT reduction measures within the development site or adjacent public right-of-way, or will require the payment of the Active Transportation In Lieu Fee. The fee will be collected and used by the City to construct VMT-reducing transit, bicycle, and pedestrian supporting infrastructure improvements in the areas of the City that will result in the greatest amount of use, and therefore, the greatest VMT and GHG reductions, as described in Attachment H: Complete Communities: Mobility Choices Regulation Framework. The requirements of the ordinance are location based, dependent on which Mobility Zone the development is located in. A map showing the locations of the each of the Mobility Zones is included in Attachment H, Appendix A. Based on best available data, the City is categorized into four Mobility Zones based on the general VMT efficiency of the area:

- Development within Mobility Zone 1 (Downtown) would not be required to provide VMT reduction measures or to pay the fee, as this Mobility Zone is the most VMT efficient.
- Development within Mobility Zone 2 would be required to provide 5 points of VMT reduction measures.
- Mobility Zone 3 would be required to provide 8 points of VMT reduction measures.
- Development within Mobility Zone 4 would be required to pay the Active Transportation In Lieu fee to offset new VMT.

Development within Mobility Zones 2 and 3 would not be required to pay the fee, but may choose to pay the fee in lieu of providing measure points. Certain exceptions apply, as listed in the Mobility Choices Regulations and in Appendix S. Notably, exceptions to these requirements apply for small residential developments, locally-serving retail developments, and certain industrial developments.

**B.5 How were the Mobility Zones designated?**

The City would be divided into four Mobility Zones, as follows:

- Mobility Zone 1 is the Downtown Community Planning Area.
Mobility Zone 2 includes all parcels that fall, either wholly or a portion of, within the 2035 TPA half-mile buffer. The 2035 TPAs are those based on the 2035 transit network included in the SANDAG Regional Plan (currently San Diego Forward (2015) which is generally updated every four years. The City is using the 2035 TPAs, as they are aligned with the horizon year included in the City's Climate Action Plan (CAP), and the allow the City to strategically plan for housing and employment growth as well as investment in multi-modal infrastructure around the planned transit network.

Mobility Zone 3 includes Community Planning Areas that have a VMT of 85% of the Regional Average or less for either VMT/Capita or Employee VMT/employee.

All other Community Planning Areas were designated as Mobility Zone 4. Parcels that were not entirely within one CPA were assigned the Mobility Zone for which the majority of the parcel is within. If there was a large immovable barrier blocking access to the transit service, parcels within Mobility Zone 2 were designated the mobility zone of the CPA within which it was located.

Mobility Zones 1, 2, and 3 are considered to be VMT efficient areas and investments in VMT reducing infrastructure results in the greatest potential to achieve Citywide VMT reductions in these areas. Additional information regarding the framework for the Mobility Choices Regulations is included in Attachment H: Complete Communities: Mobility Choices Regulation Framework, dated January 29, 2020.

B.6 How will the Mobility Choices Regulations be implemented?

To offset development VMT, new development located within Mobility Zones 2 or 3 will implement VMT reduction measures totaling 5 or 8 points respectively. Implementation of these measures in Mobility Zones 2 and 3 helps to encourage the use of non-auto transportation and contribute to VMT reduction. These VMT reduction measures will be located within the development site or in the adjacent right of way and would be privately maintained. Developments would be required to post a notice outlining the measures implemented. VMT reduction measures include pedestrian measures, such as installing enhanced crosswalks, bicycle supportive measures, such as providing an on-site shared bicycle fleet, transit supportive measures, such as upgrading a transit stop, as well as additional supportive measures, such as installing traffic calming measures. The full suite of VMT reduction measures is outlined in Appendix S of the Land Development Manual (Attachment F).
Points were assigned to each measure based upon documented effectiveness of the measure and the relative cost of the measure (as compared to other measures). Full explanation of VMT reduction measure points calculation is available in Attachment H: Complete Communities: Mobility Choices Regulation Framework, Appendix B: Complete Communities: Mobility Choices Regulation Framework Measures and Points Calculations.

To offset development VMT, new development located within Mobility Zone 4 would be required to pay the Active Transportation In-Lieu fee. The Active Transportation In-Lieu fee will be used by the City to construct Citywide VMT reducing infrastructure in Mobility Zones 1, 2, and 3. These multi-modal improvements will be implemented in Mobility Zones 1, 2, and 3 as they are the areas of the City that result in greater VMT reduction potential (VMT efficient areas) as compared to areas of the City where the same measures would yield relatively lower VMT reductions (VMT inefficient areas). For example, 27 miles of bike network would need to be built in Mobility Zone 4 to yield the same VMT reduction as 1 mile of bike network in Mobility Zone 3. Implementing multi-modal improvements in Mobility Zones 1, 2, and 3 yields greater VMT reductions citywide, at lower overall costs, compared to achieving the same level of reductions within Mobility Zone 4.

A list of eligible program facilities to be constructed with funds collected from the Active Transportation In-Lieu fee is available in Appendix A of Attachment I: Mobility Choices Fee Program Nexus Study. Eligible program facilities must be walking, biking, or transit infrastructure, implementable by the City, suitable for VMT efficient areas, and have demonstrable VMT reducing potential. The list of eligible program facilities is not meant to be static or exhaustive. New and evolving technologies and facility types may be considered to the extent that they are functionally equivalent (or superior) and consistent with the purpose for which the proposed fee will be collected.

B.7 How was the Active Transportation In Lieu Fee calculated per VMT?

To calculate the Active Transportation In Lieu Fee, a unit cost per vehicle mile traveled reduced ($/VMT reduced) needed to be determined. Costs were compiled from over 50 sample developments within Mobility Zones 1, 2, and 3. Sample developments were chosen across various mobility modes (transit, bike, pedestrian) and across various facility types. For each sample development, the cost of the development and the VMT reduction potential was quantified. The average cost for each mobility mode (bike/micro mobility, transit, pedestrian) was calculated. The unit costs by mobility mode were normalized with target mode share allocations. The target
mode share allocations were based on several factors, including the mode share goals of the CAP, reasonable community investment patterns, and overall VMT reducing efficiency. The resulting unit cost per VMT reduced is $1,400. This amount provides an overall benefit to the City and to new development in that the City receives funding that can be used in areas where the greatest VMT reductions can be achieved, and new development has the opportunity to pay to reduce VMT based on their implementation in the most efficient areas of the City. The City completed an Active Transportation In Lieu Fee Nexus Study, which is included as Attachment I.

B.8 How is the Active Transportation In Lieu Fee calculated for a development?

The Active Transportation In Lieu Fee is calculated per development for the amount of additional VMT generated over the threshold (85% of the VMT/capita or employee in the region). An interactive web-based calculator will be available that will allow the public to locate their parcel by geographic panning, address, or APN. The map will link to a VMT calculator that will calculate development VMT based upon the location, size, and land use type. The calculator will provide the following information: The Mobility Zone the development is located within, VMT per capita or per employee, the total development VMT, and either the VMT Reduction Measure points requirement or the required Active Transportation In Lieu fee amount.

B.9 How would the Active Transportation In Lieu Fee streamline the process for development?

Mobility Choices comprehensively and strategically addresses citywide VMT to support investment and implementation of active transportation infrastructure in areas of the City where VMT can be more efficiently and effectively reduced. The Mobility Choices program is intended to alleviate the burden of offsetting VMT generating in VMT inefficient portions of the City through the Active Transportation Fee. The fee is intended to provide certainty and time savings in the development process. Through offsetting VMT generated in VMT inefficient portions of the City by implementation VMT reducing infrastructure in VMT efficient areas, the funds collected are used more effectively and efficiently to reduce Citywide VMT. For example, to reduce the same VMT, it would require 27 miles of bike lane in VMT inefficient areas of the City as compared to 1 mile in VMT efficient areas of the City.

Additionally, an economic analysis, Attachment J: Citywide Active Transportation In Lieu Fee Program Estimated Impacts and Cost Savings Analysis, was completed to evaluate the estimated impacts and potential costs savings for real estate developers resulting from the Mobility Choices program and Active Transportation In Lieu fee. This analysis looks at six potential
development prototypes that could occur in the VMT inefficient areas, where the Active Transportation Fee is applicable, and tested for financial feasibility of each prototype taking into consideration the cost savings provided by the program through factors such as architecture and engineering, entitlement costs, traffic studies and environmental documents, developer overhead fee, interest carry, and offsite improvements. The analysis found that the Mobility Choices program overall has the potential to enhance the feasibility of development within the VMT inefficient areas.

There are additional cost savings and efficiencies beyond what is considered in this economic analysis (Attachment J) through mitigation of VMT impacts in more VMT efficient areas (Mobility Zone 3) as opposed to less efficient areas (Mobility Zone 4). As outlined in Attachment K: Effects of VMT Reducing Infrastructure in Mobility Zone 4 vs. Mobility Zone 3, the cost is significantly higher to reduce VMT within Mobility Zone 4 as compared to Mobility Zone 3, particularly for bike facilities (a 20 to 1 ratio). In many cases, mitigation through bicycle facilities would not be feasible in Mobility Zone 4 as the length of facilities need would be far greater than the transportation network could support. If VMT impacts from development in Mobility Zone 4 were to be offset in Mobility Zone 4 and the Active Transportation Fee were to reflect that cost, the fee per mile would be approximately $4,500 to reduce one mile of vehicular traffic. By basing the Active Transportation Fee on the cost to reduce the VMT impacts created by development in Mobility Zone 4 through infrastructure implemented in VMT efficient areas of the City (Mobility Zones 1, 2, and 3), the fee is significantly reduced to $1,400 per mile of vehicular traffic and the City is able to achieve greater Citywide VMT reductions. The fee is also intended to provide certainty in the development process. A development's mitigation requirements are easily identifiable with the web-based calculator and is intended to be covered by the Programmatic Environmental Impact Report prepared for Complete Communities (see Section D).

C. What is Housing Solutions?

Housing Solutions is an opt-in incentive program that will help the City meet its RHNA targets for affordable housing and the City's climate action goals by incentivizing the construction of housing in multi-family and mixed-use commercial areas served by transit. The program will remove regulatory barriers to housing at all income levels, especially low, very low, and moderate-income households, while investing in neighborhood amenities, such as recreational opportunities, linear parks, urban plazas, cultural amenities, and promenades. See Attachment L: Housing Solutions Regulation Ordinance for the regulations.

C.1 What does the Housing Solutions Regulation Ordinance require from a development?
Housing Solutions will require a development to do all of the following: (1) be located on a parcel within a TPA; (2) meet inclusionary housing requirements and provide an additional 10 percent of rental dwelling units to households earning up to 120 percent area median income (AMI); (3) replace equivalently-sized existing affordable units; (4) pay $9 per square foot into the Neighborhood Enhancement Fund or construct an on-site public promenade on a premises 25,000 square feet or larger with at least 200 linear feet of street frontage; and (5) meet design requirements, including pedestrian-oriented design, Climate Action Plan consistency checklist requirements, and implement special standards for structures over 90 feet or adjacent to a freeway.

C.2 What incentives does the Housing Solutions Regulation Ordinance provide to a development?
Developments that meet all five program requirements will receive the following incentives: (1) ministerial approval with limited exceptions (e.g., developments in Environmentally Sensitive Lands must follow existing regulations); (2) development density governed by a new floor area ratio as indicated on the “FAR Tier” allowances map and Building Code minimums; (3) development height governed by the allowed FAR (except in the Coastal Height Overlay Zone); (4) Affordable Housing Incentives and Waivers; and (5) scaling of development impact fees (DIF) based on development square footage.

C.3 What are the FAR Tiers?
The density incentive is divided into three tiers based on FAR, which is the relationship between the total amount of usable floor area a building has compared to the total area of the lot. The ratio is determined by dividing the total or gross floor area of the building by the gross area of the lot. Attachment M: Housing Solutions Floor Area Ratio (FAR) Allowances Map shows the following FAR tiers: FAR Tier 1 covers downtown San Diego and has no limit on FAR; FAR Tier 2, which covers the City’s urban core, has an 8.0 limit on FAR; and FAR Tier 3, which includes suburban TPAs, has a 4.0 limit on FAR. These divisions were determined in coordination with the Mobility Choices Mobility Zones. The Housing Solutions initiative encompasses all parcels zoned for multi-family residential development within Mobility Zone 2 (i.e., TPAs). The three tiers were then developed through consideration of forecast vehicle miles traveled across all mobility zones; recent and anticipated development patterns Citywide, including employment centers and neighborhood growth; and recent and ongoing community plan updates. These factors were considered together to determine where additional density aligns with mobility, RHNA, CAP, and equity goals.
C.4  How does the infrastructure amenity requirement benefit neighborhoods?
The program requires a payment to the Neighborhood Enhancement Fund or the provision of an on-site public promenade. The intent of this requirement is to provide quality of life improvements for all residents as new development is added to neighborhoods. The Neighborhood Enhancement Fund will be used for design, construction, and/or maintenance of neighborhood-enhancing infrastructure projects, specifically projects that enhance a sense of place, facilitate pedestrian circulation, improve connections to transit, and promote livability and vitality. The fee will be set at $9.00 per square foot of lot area, and buildings over 90 feet in height will pay an additional 25 percent of the established fee. Fees will be divided with 50 percent invested in infrastructure improvements within the same community planning area as the development and 50 percent invested in infrastructure improvements within Communities of Concern, as identified by the City’s Climate Equity Index, which was developed by the City in coordination with an Equity Stakeholder Working Group. See Attachment N: Resolution to Approve the Neighborhood Enhancement Fund for additional information.

Development on a premises 25,000 square feet in area or larger with at least 200 linear feet of street frontage may construct on-site public amenities in the form of a public promenade, which is a public open space that adjoins or is visible from a public right-of-way along the longest street frontage. A public promenade must meet a range of requirements for landscaping, lighting, access, recreation, seating, wayfinding, and other amenities that contribute to a sense of place, facilitate pedestrian circulation, improve connections to transit, and promote livability and vitality. The development must also hold a minimum of two public design charrettes for the community to receive information and provide feedback on proposed promenade design concepts.

C.6  What is Housing Solutions’ relationship to CASA and other recent housing legislation?
Housing Solutions is the proposed local implementation of CASA and AB 1763, with additional flexibility built in, based upon input received from the public. CASA, AB 1763, and Housing Solutions all require at least 20 percent of a development be comprised of affordable units to participate and both embrace increased density as an incentive. Housing Solutions contains many similar provisions to both CASA and AB 1763, but it provides more flexibility, is tailored to our local conditions, and incorporates more neighborhood amenities.

Housing Solutions provides more locations where developments may opt-in (i.e., Housing Solutions includes parcels zoned for 5 dwelling units or
more and parcels zoned nonresidential, whereas CASA requires parcels to be zoned for 20 units or more and can only be residential or mixed-use); offers additional incentives to make developments more financially feasible (i.e., Housing Solutions offers more FAR and does not include the strict limitation on height restrictions); allows for affordable units to be provide on- or off-site; and requires community infrastructure / pedestrian amenities in exchange for the added density that will be added to neighborhoods through this program.

Housing Solutions also provides greater flexibility than AB 1763 in terms of height (i.e., height is governed by FAR as opposed to a one-size-fits-all height increase of up to 33 feet) and offers a broader spectrum for meeting the affordable dwelling unit income category requirements.

D. What does the Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices Environmental Impact Report cover?

The EIR prepared for Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices, Attachment O, analyzed the potential environmental impacts of implementation of each of the components of the programs. As a programmatic document for a policy initiative, needed mitigation to address any potential significant environmental impacts was incorporated into the proposed regulations and policies of the programs, to the extent feasible. As development under the opt-in Housing Solutions program would be processed ministerially, no future environmental review would occur, and the programmatic EIR adequately analyzes those impacts. Likewise, the EIR analyzes the impacts associated with implementation of the Mobility Choices program and incorporates required mitigation to the extent feasible within the Mobility Choices Regulations. See Attachment P: Resolution Certifying the Complete Communities EIR.

E. Conclusion

Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions provides a comprehensive approach to addressing the City’s urgent need for more housing while reducing Citywide VMT and GHG emissions. The initiative prioritizes investment in active transportation infrastructure in areas that have the potential to reduce the greatest number of vehicle trips and seeks to address the housing affordability crisis by locating affordable housing near existing transit services, jobs, and community amenities. Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions implements the Climate Action Plan and the City of Villages strategy and will provide quality neighborhoods that are diverse, walkable, connected, safe, and sustainable. This initiative will ensure that all residents have access to resources, healthy environments, and thriving communities to improve the quality of their lives.

City Strategic Plan Goal(s)/Objective(s):
Goal #1: Provide high quality public service
  Objective #1: Promote a customer-focused culture that prizes accessible, consistent, and predictable delivery of services
  Objective #2: Improve external and internal coordination and communication
  Objective #3: Consistently collect meaningful customer feedback

Goal #2: Work in partnership will all of our communities to achieve safe and livable neighborhoods
  Objective #3 Invest in quality infrastructure
  Objective #4 Foster services that improve quality of life
  Objective #5: Cultivate civic engagement and participation
  Objective #6: Decrease unsheltered homelessness

Goal #3: Create and sustain a resilient and economically prosperous City
  Objective #1: Create dynamic neighborhoods that incorporate mobility, connectivity, and sustainability
  Objective #3: Diversify and grow the local economy
  Objective #4: Prepare and respond to climate change
  Objective #7: Increase the net supply of affordable housing

Fiscal Considerations:

Environmental Impact:
A Final Environmental Impact Report, Report SCH No. 2006091032, has been prepared. The public review comment period ended on March 12, 2020 and responses to the comments received are included in the Final EIR.

Equal Opportunity Contracting Information (if applicable): N/A

Previous Council and/or Committee Actions:
On October 2, 2019, Mobility Choices was presented as an information item to the Active Transportation and Infrastructure Committee.

On December 6, 2019, Housing Solutions was presented as an information item to the Land Use & Housing Committee.

On December 10, 2019, Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions was presented to the Community Planners Committee as an information item.

On January 8, 2020, Mobility Choices was presented as an information item to the City’s Mobility Board.

On January 28, 2020, Complete Communities: Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions
was presented to the City's Equity Stakeholder Working Group.

Key Stakeholders and Community Outreach Efforts:
Planning Department staff conducted a public outreach process to seek feedback from a wide range of stakeholders, which included community events, online engagement, scoping meetings, meetings with business and property owners, housing advocacy groups, and other interested parties. Some of the outreach methods included the following:

1. Four stakeholder focus group meetings were held to discuss the draft Housing Solutions regulations on May 30, 2019; May 31, 2019; June 10, 2019; and June 13, 2019. These meetings were attended by affordable housing developers, climate and transit advocates, market-rate housing developers, and representatives from economic development and business associations. This outreach is summarized in Attachment Q: Transit Priority Area Housing and Infrastructure Incentive Program Summary of Stakeholder Feedback.

2. A scoping meeting was held for the Complete Communities EIR on Wednesday, June 26, 2019 at the Mission Valley Library to solicit public input on the scope and content of the Program EIR;

3. Community outreach at the Transit and Tacos event in City Heights on August 30, 2019. Outreach was conducted at the outset of the Mobility Choices program development to engage with and gather input from participants on transportation amenities that would encourage them to bike or take public transit more often and to provide feedback on what kinds of benefits they wanted to see from the City's transportation network. This outreach effort is summarized in Attachment R;

4. A dedicated online portal for the Complete Communities program was launched on December 5, 2019 that contains an overview of the program, informational video, dedicated pages for both the Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices programs, fact sheets for the program and an online engagement tool. The online engagement tool, available in both Spanish and English, to raise awareness about the Complete Communities programs. The tool included a survey that contained multiple choice and open-ended questions to gather feedback from the public on what types of improvements they would like to see in their neighborhoods, preferred location for these improvements, and to better understand general community knowledge of the City's programs. The tool had 137 participants as of April 21, 2020;

5. On May 1, 2020, a dedicated webpage with project information and surveys for both the Mobility Choices and Housing Solutions programs were posted to the Planning Department website and shared with interested parties and stakeholders via an email distribution list.
Additionally, staff promoted the Complete Communities: Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices program through a variety of media outlets including social media posts on Facebook and Instagram. Staff has provided regular updates on the draft Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices program through the Complete Communities website.

Attachments:

Attachment A: Equity Maps
Attachment B: Mobility Choices Regulation Ordinance
Attachment C: Resolution to Adopt the Active Transportation Fee
Attachment D: CEQA Significance Determination Threshold for Transportation
Attachment E: Appendix R: Transportation Study Manual
Attachment F: Appendix S: Mobility Choices Implementation Guidelines
Attachment G: Resolution to Amend the Land Development Manual
Attachment H: Complete Communities: Mobility Choices Regulation Framework
Attachment I: Active Transportation In Lieu Fee Nexus Study
Attachment J: Citywide Active Transportation In Lieu Fee Program Estimated Impacts and Cost Savings Analysis
Attachment K: Effects of VMT Reducing Infrastructure in Mobility Zone 4 vs Mobility Zone 3
Attachment L: Housing Solutions Regulation Ordinance
Attachment M: Housing Solutions Floor Area Ratio (FAR) Allowances Map
Attachment N: Resolution to Approve the Neighborhood Enhancement Fund
Attachment O: Final PEIR
Attachment P: Resolution Certifying the Complete Communities EIR
Attachment Q: Transit Priority Area Housing and Infrastructure Incentive Program Summary of Stakeholder Feedback
Attachment R: Transit and Tacos: Bringing Transportation Planning to the Streets Summary Report
Communities of Concern
Mobility Zone 1: No Limit on FAR
Mobility Zone 2: 8.0 FAR
Mobility Zone 3: 4.0 FAR
Not Applicable
Transit Priority Areas